

National Research University Higher School of Economics

As a manuscript

Belous Iuliia Alexandrovna

**FACTORS OF CENTRIFUGAL POLITICAL TENDENCIES
IN THE REGIONALIST EU MEMBER STATES
(CASE OF SPAIN)**

SUMMARY OF THE DISSERTATION

for the purpose of obtaining academic degree
Doctor of Philosophy in History

Academic Supervisor:

Doctor of Sciences

Professor

Krivushin Ivan Vladimirovich

Moscow, 2023

Research design

Research context

Nowadays the problem of strengthening nationalist sentiments and parties, supporting the idea of independence has become widespread in the modern world. Centrifugal tendencies are on the rise, and the risk of the nation-state losing its decisive influence on the process of development and decision-making has become real in the case of the United Kingdom, Belgium and Spain. The "domino effect" can happen to a number of regions of the European Union (EU), in which nationalist sentiments are strong. Nationalist parties in the Basque Country, Catalonia and Galicia have become more popular, as evidenced by the results of general and regional elections since the early 2010s. and the "autonomous communities" ("Comunidades Autónomas")¹, which together establish the "state of autonomies", primarily with the relatively prosperous in the socio-economic terms of the Basque Country, Catalonia, are characterized by tension and have already managed to turn into system problem. At the same time, despite the fact that the Spanish Constitution prohibits a federal state, in essence, it has come close to this territorial and political structure². The question of the effectiveness of the existing territorial and political structure of Spain today is of key importance in academic debates about the future of the "State of Autonomies".

The factors of centrifugal tendencies allow us to understand their mechanics, which is necessary to prevent the risks connected with their strengthening. The Spanish case gives us the opportunity to reveal that there is no single factor that feeds centrifugal tendencies, in each case a whole complex of factors is at work. These can be both structural (permanent factors) and situational (temporary) factors of centrifugal tendencies.

With regard to the research problem, in Spain there is a higher level of resonance on the issue of territorial and political integrity than in other regionalist states of the EU (for example, Italy). Moreover, nationalist parties in regions of Spain such as the Basque Country and Catalonia have been in power for a much longer period of time than in other EU regionalist states. Also, Spain is a "Euro-optimist" country. Unlike, for example, the United Kingdom, in which specific factors (Brexit) play a special role, the Spanish case allows us to trace the factors of centrifugal tendencies characteristic of countries supporting European integration.

¹ There are 17 autonomous communities in Spain today and two autonomous cities of Ceuta and Melilla. In accordance with the approach of G.I. Volkova (see more: Volkova G. I. Spain: State of Autonomies and the Problem of Territorial Integrity. M.: MaxPress, 2011. P. 42.) we see that from a conceptual and theoretical point of view, Spain is a unitary state. However, there are significant differences between the regions in Spain, and these regions have a wide autonomy, which is not characteristic of a unitary state. Therefore, regionalist and federalizing principles are seen in the state structure of Spain.

² According to Article 145 of the Spanish Constitution. Constitución española // Boletín Oficial. Del Estado. 1978. T. 311. [Electronic resource]. URL: http://www.fonz.es/pub/documentos/documentos_Documento1_594b1f5b.pdf (accessed: 10.01.2023).

The Basque Country was chosen as the main regional case for a number of reasons. Firstly, the long tradition of self-government and the deep historical roots of the Basque nationalist movement determine our choice. Secondly, the Basque case is the starting point, since elements of all the other cases are observed. The Basque Country case is suitable for us as an approach to compare with Catalonia (in terms of the strength of centrifugal tendencies), Galicia (in terms of peripheral position) and Valencia (presence of other gravity centers). Thirdly, the struggle for independence in the Basque Country was associated historically with the spread of violent methods, used primarily by the nationalist organization "Basque Country and Freedom" (ETA) in response to the policy of the center. The violent methods of the struggle for independence became an integral part of everyday life in Basque Country in the second half of the XXth century. Although in other regions of Spain there were also nationalist organizations that used violent methods in pro-independence movement, for example, the nationalist organization Terra Lliure in Catalonia, the level of their violent activities was lower. Fourthly, the Basque Country is one of the "historical nationalities" and has the widest autonomy comparing to other autonomous communities. For instance, the financial competences are wider and can be found in "Economic agreement" ("Concierto económico")¹ based on the heritage of "fueros"². Fifthly, the Basque Country is one of the most developed economic regions in Spain. Together with Catalonia, they are the most prosperous regions of the country. Therefore, studying the example of the Basque Country seems worthy to understand the essence of centrifugal tendencies in Spain.

For the Russian Federation, the above questions are relevant due to the fact that our state is a multinational one. Therefore, the experience of Spain can be useful, especially in accordance with the country's unique territorial and political structure, cultural and linguistic diversity.

Literature review

The research problem is based on the intersection of the following research aspects. The first group includes works in which modern centrifugal tendencies are theoretically comprehended. The second group includes studies devoted to the specifics of the Spanish territorial and political structure. The third group contains studies devoted to the peculiarities of the "Basque problem" in Spain as one of the most striking variants of the centrifugal tendencies. The fourth category includes scientific works that reveal the specifics of centrifugal movements and nationalism in

¹ "Economic agreement" ("Concierto económico") governs the unique tax and financial relationship between the State and the Basque Country. It is based on a provision of the Constitution that protects and respects the historical rights of the foral territories, and on Title III of the Statute of Autonomy, which affirms that the foral territories will be able to maintain, establish and regulate their own tax system in their territory. Source by: Qué es el Concierto Económico // Euskadi.eus. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.euskadi.eus/informacion/que-es-el-ce/web01-a2conci/es/> (accessed: 31.06.2022)

² Special benefits and privileges, in particular, in trade and tax areas. They were common in the Medieval states of the Iberian Peninsula.

other regions of Spain and compare them with each other. Such studies make it possible to identify both common features and regional types of centrifugal tendencies in Spain.

In addition to academic research, we used the expert and analytical materials of the Elcano Royal Institute for International and Strategic Studies, the Barcelona Center for International Affairs (CIDOB) and an expert survey conducted during an research internship at the Autonomous University of Madrid (Madrid, Spain) from September to December 2021. A series of expert surveys on the topic of the dissertation was conducted with researchers from 17 Spanish universities and research centers of 10 Spanish cities, including Madrid, Bilbao, Valladolid, Vitoria-Gasteiz, Barcelona, Malaga, Granada, Murcia, Valencia, Salamanca. Interviews were conducted with researchers from the Autonomous University of Madrid (UAM), Pompeu Fabra University, University of the Basque Country, Autonomous University of Barcelona, Complutense University of Madrid, Rey Juan Carlos University of Madrid, University of Granada, University of Murcia, University of Valladolid, University of Salamanca, National Distance Education University (UNED), University of Pontificia Comillas, School for Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences (French: *École des hautes études en sciences sociales* (EHESS) - research center), Real Instituto Elcano (research center), Real Academia Española (cultural institution), Ateneo de Valladolid (cultural institution).

Analytical materials made it possible to understand the state of the expert discussion in modern Spain. The results of the expert survey allow us to have a deeper understanding of the Spanish history and the development of its regions, to reveal the internal logic of the academic discussion in Spain and some other EU Member States about the centrifugal / centripetal tendencies in Spain. The questionnaire consisted of eight main questions within three blocks: historical context, domestic policy and international relations.

1. In recent years, an increasing number of researchers are beginning to delve into the phenomenon of centrifugal tendencies in the Western and Southwestern European states. One of the definitions was formulated by S. Halperin and O. Heath: “Centrifugal tendencies are the escape of political power from the central government and its dispersal”¹. A different definition in relation to Belgium was given by C. Van Wynsberghe: “Another feature of Belgian federalism is its centrifugal tendency, which has led to a very specific and quite paradoxical situation where the centre of the political device (i.e. the former unitary state) was progressively drained and cleared of its competences to the polities’ benefits, but without recognizing them as actors of their own expansion”².

¹ Halperin S., Heath O. *Political Research: Methods and Practical Skills*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 2017. P. 114.

² Van Wynsberghe C. *The End of Belgium As We Know It: From Consociational Democracy to Partitocratic Deadlock?* A. López-Basaguren, L. Escajedo San-Epifanio (Eds.). *Gewerbestrasse*: Springer, 2019. P. 212.

Another view on centrifugal tendencies was offered by M. Keating ¹. He emphasizes that European regionalism is characterized by both centrifugal and centripetal tendencies. M. Keating applies the concept of centripetal and centrifugal tendencies in connection with the EU Member States policy towards the Eurozone crisis consequences. The author argues that regionalism is not a one-sided project leading to a "regional world" or a Europe of regions. On the contrary, the states remain important participants and lead to austerity, when the center increased its control ². The author gives the example of Catalonia, emphasizing that this region was striving for independence, while other regions, on the contrary, were ready to bring their powers back to the center. M. Keating also depicts the cases of France and Italy: France was not going to carry out a federal reform, but carried out a regional reform for the sake of economic development, while Italy abandoned the federal reform and transferred powers to the regional level.

One of the first to attempt to elaborate a model for explaining centrifugal tendencies in Spain was made by Colino. He correlates centrifugal tendencies with insufficiency of institutional design laid down during the period of democratic transition. According to his opinion, the existence of a "state of autonomies" prevents the federalist consciousness. Colino notes that centrifugal tendencies cause great "self-generated" instability, which gives rise to opportunistic behavior of the authorities at both levels – national and subnational (causing, for example, intervention ("la invasión") of the central government in the regions affairs and evading the responsibility of autonomous authorities) ³.

The difference between concepts of "centrifugal tendencies" and "decentralization" lies in the fact that within the latter there is a transfer of powers from the central government to lower levels of the territorial-administrative hierarchy ⁴. Researchers note that decentralization, in contrast to centrifugal tendencies, includes the creation of new units of government at the subnational level under the control of the central government ⁵. There are two forms of the transfer of power – administrative and political (democratic) decentralization. Administrative decentralization includes the transfer of technical powers from the central level to the regional and local ones ⁶. At the same time, political, or democratic, decentralization means the transfer of power to representative bodies at a lower level, for example, elected local governments. The

¹ Keating M. Contesting European regions // *Regional Studies*. 2017. №1(51). P. 16.

² Ibid.

³ Colino Camara C. Instituciones y dinámicas territoriales en el estado autonómico: una panorámica de los debates y enfoques existentes // *Las transformaciones territoriales y sociales del estado en la edad digital. Libro homenaje a Luis Moreno / F.J. Moreno Fuentes, E. Del Pino (Eds.)*. Madrid: CEPC, 2020. P. 44.

⁴ Yuliani E. L. Decentralization, deconcentration and devolution: What do they mean. In: *Interlaken Workshop on decentralization*. Center for International Forestry Research. (Interlaken), 2004. P. 27.

⁵ Look in more details: Torrisi G. Defining and measuring decentralisation: a critical review // *Munich Personal RePEc Archive*. 2011. P.4.

⁶ Ibid.

difference lies in the fact that in the first case, powers are transferred to lower executive bodies, in the second – to representative bodies of the regional and municipal levels.

As part of decentralization, there is a shift in the “locus of decision-making” from the central government to regional or municipal authorities. As for the centrifugal tendencies – there is not just a transfer of powers from the center to the regions, but the regions also are making efforts to increase their powers. One of the important features of centrifugal tendencies is the request of regional authorities to expand their powers in order to gain greater independence from the center.

According to Kokorkhoeva, the degree of decentralization depends on the ratio of centrifugal and centripetal tendencies. Author refers to the classification of Turovsky, who among the most important factors of centrifugal tendencies noted the strength of regional identity, the economic potential of the territory, geographical location, multi-ethnicity, religious characteristics, historical traditions, the importance of the experience of other countries. The emergence of centrifugal forces is associated by Evtushkin with the factor of "regional identity", and centripetal - with the presence of a common state idea ¹.

Other researchers have defined mostly nationalism as the form that centrifugal tendencies take. Among such studies, Drobizheva's article, in which the author summarizes key approaches to understanding nationalism, identifies its types and reveals the potential of “liberal nationalism” ². The contribution to the academic discussion on nationalism was made by Puzyrev, who considered the nationalist movements of the countries of Western Europe in a comparative perspective and proposed his own classification of nationalism in Western Europe ³. The author identified several types of nationalism, including ethno-linguistic and national-state nationalism, which takes the form of economic and cultural regionalism as a special form of self-determination (Catalonia), cultural-historical nationalism, which takes the form of a “movement of elites” for political and state self-determination (Scotland), ethno-cultural and ethnolinguistic nationalism in the form of a mass movement for political and state self-determination (Basque Country), ethnocultural and ethnolinguistic nationalism in the form of "latent resistance", regional isolationism and terrorism (Corsica) ⁴.

Moreover, K. Puzyrev applied the notion of "secessionism" instead of "separatism" and identified the differences between secessionism in the Western European states at the beginning

¹ Evtushkin I.V. Territorial autonomy institution in the context of centripetal trends in political system: theoretical issues // *Society: politics, economics, law*. 2019. № 8 (73). P. 49.

² Drobizheva L. Is constructive nationalism possible? // *Russia in Global Affairs*. 2008. № 6. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://globalaffairs.ru/articles/vozmozhen-li-konstruktivnyj-nacjonalizm/> (accessed: 23.07.2021).

³ Puzyrev K.S. Problems of typologisation and expertise of the potential of various types of regional separatism in Western Europe countries // *Bulletin of Kemerovo State University*. 2011. № 4. P. 123.

⁴ *Ibid.* P. 123.

of the XXIst century from "secessionism" in previous historical periods ¹. The author reveals the specific features of "secessionism", including the consistent rejection of violent methods to achieve political goals, voting in elections and referendums as the main political tool, and "secessionism" itself as a reaction to discrimination from the center ². He emphasizes that modern "secessionism" is generated by a systemic crisis of state institutions, when it has lost its monopoly on the legal use of violence, while modern separatists seek to integrate into global political networks ³.

Narochnitskaya clarifies that "separatism" and "secessionism" can be used as synonyms⁴. In particular, she highlighted the ambivalent nature of secessionism, autonomism and regionalism⁵. Narochitskaya offers her own typology of separatism ⁶. She analyzes the approaches of other researchers and combines the existing classification criteria – the degree of actual (illegitimate) control of separatists over the territory, as well as the scope and nature of the separatism (peaceful, violently armed ⁷ and ideological or mental separatism, manifested as a discursive or public option of separatism) ⁸. At the same time, E. Narochitskaya points out that despite she provides an incomplete overview of the options of separatism, she seeks to show the full complexity of this phenomenon. As a result, the researcher concludes that the issue of secession is especially important for integral studies and is "destined to be interdisciplinary in nature" ⁹.

Summarizing the points of view of these authors, we define centrifugal tendencies in accordance with the approach of Hanks as a weakening of the territorial integrity of the state ¹⁰. At the same time, centrifugal forces are phenomena of a socio-economic, political and socio-cultural nature that weaken this integrity. In addition, the center itself can also be a trigger for centrifugal tendencies if its actions or inaction fuel the aspiration of the regions for greater independence.

Thus, researchers have defined the concept of "centrifugal tendencies". However, this concept overlaps in content with a number of other, such as "nationalism", "regionalism", "autonomy" and "autonomism", "separatism". In our case, by "nationalism" we understand a

¹ Puzyrev K.S. Regional secessionism in modern Europe: origins and features of manifestations // Bulletin of Kemerovo State University. 2015. № 2 (62). P. 85.

² Ibid. P. 87.

³ Ibid. P. 88.

⁴ Narochitskaya E. A. Separatism: Varieties, typology and European realities // Current problems of Europe. 2015. № 1. P. 33.

⁵ Narochitskaya E. A. Interpreting separatism. Secessionism, autonomism, regionalism: Ambivalent relationship // Current problems of Europe. 2015. № 1. P. 14.

⁶ Narochitskaya E. A. Separatism: Varieties... P. 33.

⁷ Ibid. P. 35.

⁸ Ibid. P. 37.

⁹ Ibid. P. 54.

¹⁰ Hanks R. R. Encyclopedia of Geography. Terms, Themes and Concepts. Santa Barbara (CA). 2011. P. 55.

politicized manifestation of ethnicity¹. Volkova reduces most nationalist ideas to three options: “there is some ethnic community or nation (nación) with special features, the interests and values of this nation have priority over others, the nation should be more independent in making decisions related to its interests”². In accordance with the approach of Volkova "regionalism" is defined as "territorial decentralization of public authority and administration, aimed at the allocation and creation of large territorial units with high independence, differing in geographical, economic, historical, ethnic and other features"³. We also put into the concept of "regionalism", as suggested by Volkova, "activities of the regions aimed at expanding their rights (political, economic, cultural)"⁴. By “autonomy” we mean a territorial unit with a self-governing status, which provides the ability to independently solve its internal problems outside the limits of the rights and powers of the state⁵. "Autonomism" is the requirement to grant greater independence to a certain territory, allocated on a geographical, political, ethnic basis⁶. The concept of "separatism" is defined in accordance with the approach of Tishkov as "the demand for sovereignty and independence for an ethnically designated territory, and this demand is directed against the central power of the country"⁷. The concept of "secession" we understand as "withdrawal from the state of any territorial part"⁸. In our dissertation, we apply the approach of Narochitskaya and use the terms "separatism" and "secessionism" as synonyms.

To conclude, the concepts mentioned above still exist in the academic literature and often replace one with another in meaning. The authors are right that the concept of centrifugal tendencies, being broader, helps to unify the phenomena. At the same time, the conceptual design of the notion of centrifugal tendencies in foreign and Russian scientific literature is still insufficient. Moreover, attempts at conceptualization of this notion remain unrelated and fragmented. The author of the dissertation considers it useful and important to supplement the concept of centrifugal tendencies and demonstrate its applicability using a number of subregional examples.

2. The interest of Russian and foreign researchers in the development of a special territorial and political model in Spain increased in the last third of the XXth century and continues to this day. In previous periods, two models of the territorial and political structure can be

¹ Volkova G. I. Spain: State of Autonomies... P. 102.

² Ibid.

³ Ibid. P. 103.

⁴ Ibid. P. 104.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Tishkov V.A. Morality of separatism // Blog of V.A. Tishkov. [Electronic resource]. URL: http://www.valerytishkov.ru/cntnt/publikacii3/lekcii2/lekcii/n61_moralno.html (accessed: 12.12.2022).

⁸ Egorova M.A. The problem of the grounds and forms of political secession in modern Western Europe: PhD theses. M. 2009. P. 3.

distinguished – the model that existed under the House of Habsburg (1516-1700), and the model that was established under the House of Bourbon (1700-1868 and 1874-1931). Under the Habsburg model, centralization was not a necessary element of the territorial and political structure. The Habsburgs did not interfere with the preservation of the autonomy of the regions of Spain, while the representatives of the House of Bourbon sought to greater centralization of power.

Stepan defines the Spanish model of decentralization as a “holding together”¹. According to his approach, centrifugal tendencies are not novel for Spain, they are typical for entire historical development of Spain². Indeed, Spain's unusual territorial-political structure has been studied by many researchers and scholars, and almost all of them have emphasized the unique character of the Spanish model. The territorial-political model of “holding together” implies the creation of mechanisms for the decentralization of power in the regions of state that require them. The Spanish model is asymmetric because some territories are "historical nationalities" and have long-standing traditions of self-rule. Catalonia, the Basque Country and Galicia developed their own Statutes of Autonomy, later Andalusia followed them. Other regions were slower to develop Statutes; to some extent, they were even "hurried up" by the center.

The approval of a new territorial and political structure of Spain after 1975 had a number of important consequences³. For instance, a large degree of autonomy in some regions favored the dominance of nationalist parties in regional political system (the Convergence and Union coalition in Catalonia, the Basque Nationalist Party in the Basque Country). Among the reasons for this dominance are the features of the cultural and historical development of these regions, the electoral system, the absence of a strong institution of territorial representation in modern Spain. The consequence of the institutional design defect was the "uncertainty, asymmetry and instability of financial arrangements", which increased tensions between the regional nationalist parties and the central authorities⁴.

In recent years, an increasing number of researchers have been studying the features of the “state of autonomy” model in Spain as one of the most striking examples of regionalized EU Member States. Among foreign scientists, this problem received the greatest coverage in academic articles and papers of Guibernau⁵, L. Moreno⁶, Sanjaume-Calvet and Riera-Gil⁷, Rodríguez-

¹ Stepan A.C. Federalism and democracy: Beyond the US Model // *Journal of Democracy*. 1999. T. 10. P. 22.

² Ibid.

³ In particular, the features of the electoral system, the weak institution of territorial representation in Spain.

⁴ Colino Camara C. *Instituciones y dinámicas territoriales...* P. 45.

⁵ Guibernau M. Secessionism in Catalonia: After democracy // *Ethnopolitics: Formerly Global Review of Ethnopolitics*. 2013. № 4(12) P. 368–393.

⁶ Moreno L. Decentralization in Spain // *Regional Studies*. 2002. №36(4) P. 399-408.

⁷ Sanjaume-Calvet M., Riera-Gil E. Languages, secessionism and party competition in Catalonia: A case of de-ethnicising outbidding? // *Party Politics*. 2022. T. 28. № 1.P. 85-104.

Teruel and Barrio ¹, Muñoz ², Tengarrinha and Almuiña Fernández ³, Rodon and Amat ⁴, C. Moreno ⁵. According to these authors, the Spanish model of decentralization promotes both centrifugal and centripetal tendencies, and there are various constitutional mechanisms in Spain that can facilitate the devolution of decision-making power to the regional level.

The features of the Spanish territorial model were at the center of the study of experts from the Elcano Royal Institute for International and Strategic Studies. For example, the authors of the analytical report “The Conflict for Independence in Catalonia” offer their own interpretation of why the Spanish territorial model is unique. Researchers point to a number of features, for example, Spain formed as an empire successfully and remained relatively isolated from a number of conflicts on the continent ⁶. The authors also emphasize that Spain experienced early and effective nation-building between the XVth and XVIIIth centuries, while modern nation-building took place much later, in the XIXth and XXth centuries with great upheavals ⁷. Both processes taking place under the leadership of Castile, which occupied a central position in the territorial-political structure ⁸.

A contribution to the research of the evolution of the Spanish territorial-political structure was made by Tengarrinha and Almuiña Fernández ⁹. In its turn, C. Moreno put forward for discussion the idea of a state that democratically accepts its divisibility, and analyzed the benefits and advantages offered by such a flexible concept of the state, especially with “separatist tensions” ¹⁰. These research papers are valuable because allow us to form a general idea of why the “State of Autonomies” became the most relevant option of the territorial-political structure in Spain after 1975. At the same time, the authors paid less attention to the costs that accompany the development of the “State of Autonomies”, although this could would enrich significantly the understanding of why "separatist tensions" still exist.

¹ Rodríguez-Teruel J., Barrio A. The Asymmetrical Effect of Polarization on Support for Independence: The Case of Catalonia // *Politics and Governance*. 2021. T. 9. № 4. P. 412-425.

² Muñoz J. The Catalan Syndrome? Revisiting the Relationship Between Income and Support for Independence in Catalonia // *Politics and Governance*. 2021. T. 9. № 4. P. 376-385.

³ Tengarrinha J., Almuiña Fernández C. Iberismo y Nacionalismos Peninsulares // *Actas del XV Congreso de la Asociación de Historiadores de la Comunicación*. 2018. № 11. P. 17-45.

⁴ Amat F., Rodon T. Institutional commitment problems and regional autonomy: The Catalan case // *Politics and Governance*. 2021. T. 9. № 4. P. 439-452.

⁵ Moreno C. La secesión como procedimiento a largo plazo frente a la demanda de un referéndum único. Una propuesta de regulación // *Revista de Estudios Políticos*. 2020. T. 188. P. 97-126.

⁶ The independence conflict in Catalonia // Real Instituto Elcano. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.realinstitutoelcano.org/en/work-document/the-independence-conflict-in-catalonia/> (accessed: 01.05.2023).

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Tengarrinha J., Almuiña Fernández C. Iberismo y Nacionalismos Peninsulares... P. 17.

¹⁰ Moreno C. La secesión como procedimiento a largo plazo... P. 97.

Many Russian scholars, such as Volosyuk, Lipkin and Yurchik ¹, Volkova ² and Dementiev ³, Orlov ⁴, Khenkin ⁵, Anikeeva ⁶, Prokhorenko ⁷, Yakovlev ⁸, Koval ⁹, Kuznetsov, Kuznetsova ¹⁰ and Vernikov ¹¹, have studied the features of “state of autonomies” territorial model. The works of these researchers were valuable for us to highlight peculiarities of the domestic political development of Spain in different historical periods.

The features of the Spanish regional nationalism in the XXth century are considered in the collective monograph "History of Spain"¹². The interaction of "regional" and "ethnic" trends in the socio-historical development of Spain and the historical cultural and linguistic diversity of the population of Spain as a "state of autonomy" Henkin ¹³. A comprehensive political history of Spain from the first third of the XXth century until 2004, including the features of the “State of Autonomies” and the development of regions in it, were studied by Volkova and A.V. Dementiev¹⁴.

Orlov made a significant contribution to the study of historical features of territorial and political development of centrifugal tendencies in Spain. The author delves into whether modern centrifugal tendencies in Spain can be rooted in antiquity, and in order to answer this question he turns to the pre-Roman history of the region ¹⁵. The author gives two explanations for centrifugal

¹ History of Spain. Vol. 2. From the War of the Spanish Succession to the beginning of the XXI century / ed. M.A. Lipkin, O.V. Volosyuk, E.E. Yurchik. M.: Indrik, 2014. 800 p.

² Volkova G. I. Spain: State of Autonomies and the Problem of Territorial Integrity. M.: MaxPress, 2011. 328 p.; Volkova G. I. Spain and Regions: Policy Challenges and Priorities of the XXI century / ed. A.V. Shestopal. M.: MGIMO, 2014. 336 p.

³ Volkova G. I., Dementiev A.V. Political history of Spain. M.: Higher school, 2005. 194 p.

⁴ Orlov A.A. Key problems of modern Spain // Cuadernos Iberoamericanos. 2016. № 1(11). P. 9-14.

⁵ Khenkin S. M. State of Autonomies and Federations: Similarities and Differences // Regions and Center: How to Build Relationships? Spanish variant. 2008. P. 9-18.

⁶ Anikeeva N. E. Spain - State of Autonomies in United Europe // Contemporary Europe - Sovremennaya Evropa. 2007. No. 2 (30). P. 91-103.

⁷ Prokhorenko I.L. Spain in the European Union: mutual influence of national and transnational political spaces: PhD theses. M. 2015. 282 p.; Prokhorenko I.L. Regions of Spain in the political space of the European Union // Moscow University Bulletin of World Politics. 2011. 25(1). P. 32-48.; Prokhorenko I.L. The policy of regional development of Spain: mechanisms and tools // World Economy and International Relations. M. 2015. No. 5. P. 41-51.

⁸ Yakovlev P.P. Foreign policy of Spain and the formation of a multipolar world // Latin America - 2011. No. 10. P. 17-33.

⁹ Koval T.B. Modern Spain: in the labyrinth of identities // Cultural complexity of modern nations. Collective monograph / ed. V.A. Tishkov, E.I. Filippova. N.N. Miklukho-Maklai Institute of Anthropology and Ethnography RAS. M.: Political Encyclopedia, 2016. P. 57-78.; Koval T.B. Large and small homeland in Spain / ed. V.L. Vernikov // Spain in a Changing World: On the 40th anniversary of re-establishment of diplomatic relations between Russia and Spain. M.: Institute of Europe RAS. 2017. P. 54-66.

¹⁰ Regional Policy of EU countries // ed. by A. Kuznetsov / Centre for European Studies of IMEMO RAS. M.: IMEMO RAS. 2009. 230 p.; Regional Policy of EU countries // ed. by A. Kuznetsov / Centre for European Studies of IMEMO RAS. M.: IMEMO RAS. 2015. 137 p.

¹¹ Spain in a Changing World: On the 40th anniversary of re-establishment of diplomatic relations between Russia and Spain / ed. V.L. Vernikov. M.: Institute of Europe RAS. 2017. 76 p.

¹² History of Spain. Vol. 2... P. 672-693.

¹³ Khenkin S. M. State of Autonomies and Federations... P. 9.

¹⁴ Volkova G. I., Dementiev A.V. Political history of Spain... 194 p.

¹⁵ Orlov A.A. Features of Pre-Roman history of Spain and modern time: where are sources of separatism? // MGIMO Review of International Relations. 2013. № 4 (31). P. 177-186.

tendencies in Spain: the significant influence of regional nationalism in Catalonia, the Basque Country, Navarre and Galicia, and the peculiarities of local regionalism, which are due to the desire of regional elites to gain greater isolation from Madrid ¹.

Russian authors also paid attention to the factors influencing the development of the country's territorial and political structure and the self-identification of Spanish citizens. Dividing the factors that determine the self-identification of the Spaniards, and the factors that shape their views on the existing model of the territorial-state structure, Koval notes that "Catalonia and the Basque Country give a significant shift towards an exclusively regional self-identification" ². At the same time, in these regions there are significantly more of those who have a dual identification, which means that not all residents of these areas are ready to break ties with the rest of Spain ³. In addition to regional affiliation, the author highlights age, socio-economic status, political and ideological views as factors of self-identification of Spaniards. Koval comes to the conclusion that older citizens perceive themselves to a greater extent as "only Spaniards", while among the young, only a small proportion of them feels exclusively Spaniards ⁴. In addition, she emphasizes that the middle class is more inclined to feel both Spaniard and a member of their "Autonomous Community", while the upper strata of society are aware of themselves exclusively as Spaniards⁵. Finally, Koval highlights the political and ideological factor, i.e., sympathy for the right or left parties: "double identity is developed to the greatest extent among supporters of the political center and slightly less among the left" ⁶. The extremely left felt their exclusive connection with the "small Homeland", i.e., the region ⁷. Thus, among the factors that form the self-identification of Spaniards, Koval highlights the age factor, the factor of socio-economic status and the factor of political and ideological views.

A contribution to the academic discussion about factors was made by Volkova, who emphasized that in the XIX century "nationalists adopted a number of features as a differentiating factor: language (dialect), history, geography, culture, traditions and customs, which, being elevated to the proper propagandistic level, became the basis for nationalist and separatist demands" ⁸. The author also notes that the national movements of the Catalans, Basques and Galicians developed differently, which was associated with the peculiarities of the socio-economic and political development of the Spaniards ⁹.

¹ Orlov A.A. Features of Pre-Roman history... P. 178.

² Koval T.B. Modern Spain ... P. 74.

³ Ibid.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Ibid. P. 64

⁷ Ibid. P. 65.

⁸ Volkova G. I. Spain: State of Autonomies... P. 35.

⁹ Ibid.

At the same time, in one of our expert surveys, the Spanish researcher S. de Pablo noted that “today language is a differentiating element that is important in any nationalism, but it is not the element that distinguishes an ordinary nationalist from a Basque who considers himself a Spaniard”¹. The researcher also clarified his understanding of the factors of centrifugal tendencies: “In addition to economic factors, I think factors of identity, history and culture are important. I consider that historical memory and identity are more important than specific issues such as the amount of powers a region possesses within its autonomy”².

Thus, a large number of academic literature is devoted to the study of the history and features of the Spanish territorial and political structure. Summarizing the results of research on the features of the "State of Autonomy", we can distinguish several approaches to its analysis: chronological, i.e., the stages of evolution of the territorial and political structure of Spain, normative, i.e., identifying the legal framework of the Spanish state development, and sociological, i.e., finding out how the Spaniards evaluated this territorial-political model. At the same time, in all academic papers, we see a significant difference in evaluating which factors form the views of the Spaniards on the existing model of territorial structure, determine the self-identification, or which of them are used by nationalist forces in order to build a political strategy. In general, there are disagreements in the academic literature regarding the factors of centrifugal tendencies, and they are not systematized enough.

3. Russian and foreign authors paid attention to the peculiarities of the development of centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country. The most significant contribution to the analytical support of these processes were made by Pablo, Pobes, Granja³, Mees⁴, Medrano⁵, Elorza⁶,

¹ Santiago de Pablo, Prof., University of the Basque Country, Faculty of Arts, Vitoria-Gasteiz, Spain, 03.12.2021. (Expert survey time: 60 min.).

² Ibid.

³ Pablo S., Granja J. L., Pobes C. R. Breve historia de Euskadi: de los Fueros a la Autonomía. Barcelona (Spain), 2020. 320 p.; Granja Sainz J. L. Comunitàon y Aberri, las dos caras del PNV // La Aventura de la historia. 2021. № 273. P. 38-41

⁴ Mees L. Between votes and bullets. Conflicting ethnic identities in the Basque Country // Ethnic and racial studies. 2001. T. 24. № 5. P. 798-827.; Mees L. The Basque contention: Ethnicity, politics, violence. London: Routledge, 2019, 200 p.

⁵ Medrano J. D. The effects of ethnic segregation and ethnic competition on political mobilization in the Basque Country // American Sociological Review. 1988. P. 873-889.

⁶ Elorza A. La Nación Vasca: del Mito a la Historia // Nacionalismo y democracia / Francisco J. Llera ... [et al.]: Ediciones Universidad de Salamanca. 2003. №1. P. 109-110.

Keating and Bray ¹, Tejadura Tejada ². Among Russian researchers, the most in-depth analysis of the Basque Country case was made by Orlov ³, Khenkin ⁴ and Kozhanovsky ⁵.

At the same time, it is worth dividing the authors of this group into the following subgroups: 1) the history of Basque nationalism within the relations between the region and center before the "State of Autonomies"; 2) the history of the relations between the region and center in the post-Franco period (centrifugal tendencies); 3) the evolution of Basque nationalism in the late 1970s and early 2000s (before the Global Financial and Economic Crisis). In general, researchers of various fields (history, law, political science, sociology, economics) have different vision and give different evaluation criteria of Basque autonomism and nationalism. The multidisciplinary nature of the dissertation research allows us to trace this differentiation of assessments and opinions.

Mees studied the history of relations between the center and Basque Country before the "State of Autonomies". He identified the features of their relationship and reconstructed a comprehensive picture of Basque history from the XIV-XVth centuries ⁶. In its turn, Professor S. de Pablo, emphasized: "I do not think that one can understand what happened in relations between the center and Basque Country after 1975 without taking into account the previous history of nationalist movements in Spain. Because the democratic transition was an attempt to solve the problems that Spain had been facing since the end of the XIXth century" ⁷. Indeed, the origins of the Basque nationalist movement should be found in the history of the region before 1975.

Moreover, Pablo, Granja Sainz and Pobes studied the history of the Basque Country political development from the Medieval time (from "fueros") until the creation of an Autonomous communities. They also suggested their own periodization of this historical period ⁸. They

¹ Keating M., Bray Z. Renegotiating sovereignty: Basque nationalism and the rise and fall of the Ibarretxe plan // *Ethnopolitics*. 2006. T. 5. № 4. P. 347-364; Keating M. New Regionalism as an Opportunity // *Russia in Global Affairs*. 2008. Vol. 6. No. 4. P. 143-148.

² Tejadura Tejada J. La cooperación horizontal como garantía del pluralismo territorial. Reflexiones sobre una asignatura pendiente del Estado Autonómico Español // *Garantías del pluralismo territorial*. 2011. P. 45-70; Tejadura Tejada J. Referéndum en el País Vasco (Comentario a la STC 103/2008). 2009. P. 363-385; Tejadura Tejada J., Arlucea E: *Los territorios históricos de la Comunidad Autónoma Vasca*. Fundación Elkarquea, Bilbao. 2000. P. 271-273.

³ Orlov A.A. Debate in ETA about its future: the last step before the dissolution of the terrorist syndicate // *Cuadernos Iberoamericanos*. 2018. № 1. P. 7-12.; Orlov A.A. Basque terrorism has gone down in history // *Observer*. 2018. №5 (340). P.52-62.; Orlov A.A. Cessation of armed activity of ETA: end of terrorism in Spain or new respite? // *MGIMO Review of International Relations*. 2011. №6(21). P. 86-90.; Orlov A.A. Disarmament of ETA: the era of the Basque terrorism comes to an end // *Cuadernos Iberoamericanos*. №2(16). P. 7-14.

⁴ Khenkin S.M. "The Basque problem" as the factor of disunity in the Spanish polity // *Political Science*. 2016. № 1. P. 124-146; Khenkin S. M., Samsonkina E. S. *Basque conflict: roots, character, metamorphosis*. Moscow, MGIMO (U) MID Rossii, 2011. 380 p.

⁵ Kozhanovsky A.N. «The Basque Question»: Ethnic or Territorial? // *Social Sciences and Contemporary World*. 2011. №6. P. 110–122.

⁶ Mees L. *The Basque contention: Ethnicity, politics, violence...* P. 5.

⁷ Santiago de Pablo, Prof., University of the Basque Country, Faculty of Arts, Vitoria-Gasteiz, Spain, 03.12.2021. (Expert survey time: 60 min.).

⁸ Pablo S., Granja J. L., Pobes C. R. *Breve historia de Euskadi...* P. 3.

emphasized that BNP played a crucial role in the formation of the discourse on the uniqueness of the Basque Country in comparison with other regions of Spain.

A similar position was held by the Basque jurist Tejadura Tejada. He applies a normative approach to the study of Basque nationalism ¹. In particular, he considered the features of the legal procedure for holding a referendum on the independence of the Basque Country ². In an expert survey, he clarified that “an unusual phenomenon was observed in the Basque Country – the activity of a nationalist political party. Spain has carried out a process of decentralization in all Autonomous Communities, but it was the BNP who always maintained that the Basque Country cannot be a community like any other, it should be different. The political elites of this region managed to include in the Constitution a direct indication of this region’s uniqueness, so called historical rights ³. In this case, we see a different approach to study the Basque nationalism – an attempt to determine the role of the BNP in the development of modern constitutional regime in Spain.

A contribution to the study of the history of relations between the Basque Country and the center in the post-Franco period was made by Orlov ⁴. The researcher came to the following conclusion: despite the fact that the problem of Basque terrorism is a problem of the past, the struggle for independence is still supported by part of the Basque Country population ⁵. In its turn, this means that the pro-independence struggle continues, and the former members of ETA intend to play a role in such a movement. Anikeeva highlights those relations between the Basque Country and the center “can hardly be called well-established” ⁶. Among the ways to end the conflict, she singled out the fight against the ETA and its heritage. At the same time, Dronova emphasizes among the most promising tools for the final settlement of the conflict: updating the negotiation process between the Basque Country and the center with the involvement of the French side in such negotiations ⁷.

Keating delves into the negotiation process between the center and the Basque Country on the privileges of the region within the “state of autonomies”. Providing the Ibarretxe Plan as an

¹ Tejadura Tejada J., Arlucea E. Los territorios históricos de la Comunidad Autónoma Vasca. Bilbao: Fundación Elkargunea. 2000. P. 271.

² Tejadura Tejada J. Referéndum en el País Vasco... P. 363.

³ Javier Tejadura Tejada, Professor, University of the Basque Country, Department of Constitutional Law and History of Thought and of Social and Political Movements, Spain, November 24, 2021. (Expert survey time: 46 min.).

⁴ Orlov A.A. Debate in ETA about its future... P. 11.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Anikeeva N.E. The sources and the essence of the basque conflict in Spain. // MGIMO Review of International Relations. 2010. № 2. P. 103.

⁷ Dronova S. Yu. The relationship between the Basque Country and Madrid after establishing a truce with ETA: contemporaneity and the development prospects of political dialogue // Society: Politics, Economics, Law. 2017. № 2. P. 29.

example ¹, he emphasized that this project was initiated with the aim to find a balance between separatism and unionism ². Nevertheless, its effect turned out to be the opposite, and the position of the center strengthened.

Among other Russian scholars, Fadeeva came to the conclusion that one of the main prerequisites for the strengthening of disintegration tendencies within Spain is the low level of stability of the Spanish economy to systemic crises. The researcher also identified the risks of growing contradictions between the center and the Basque Country during pandemic crisis 2020-2021 ³.

Thus, in the academic literature on the history of relations between the Basque Country and Madrid in the post-Franco period, we can find three dominant plots that attracted the attention of researchers: negotiation process between the Basque Country and center about threats of ETA and tools to prevent these threats, negotiations with the center on the issue of expanding the competences of the region, the role of BNP in these processes. At the same time, the authors see differently the prospects, ways and tools for the final settlement of the conflict between the center and Basque Country. While some recognize that the conflict between this region and center is weakening, others, on the contrary, believe that today we see only a temporary lull and the conflict continues its latent existence, i.e., in other forms, albeit not in the most radical ones. It seems to us that the second approach is closer to our research. By the way, the factors that continue to stimulate centrifugal tendencies in this region have been less studied yet.

Researchers paid attention to the peculiarities of the Basque nationalism at the present stage. Keating and Bray formulated that many nationalist movements of minorities in the EU today renounce the struggle for independence, welcoming European integration, taking a “post-sovereignty” position and limiting themselves to the demand for a redistribution of competences between the center and regions ⁴. The Basque Country, according to Keating and Bray, went down this path ⁵.

The problem related to the nature of Basque nationalism was at the center of the academic research of Khenkin and Samsonkina. The authors studied the so-called "Basque conflict", which means "the opposition of the radical nationalists of the Basque Country to the center and another, moderately minded part of its society about the expediency of political and territorial demarcation

¹ The Ibarretxe Plan – a project proposed by the Basque politician Juan José Ibarretxe in 2003 and put forward by the government of the Basque Country in 2004. The main idea of this project lies in the fact that a future Basque country freely associated with Spain.

² Keating M., Bray Z. Renegotiating sovereignty: Basque nationalism and the rise and fall of the Ibarretxe plan // *Ethnopolitics*. 2006. T. 5. № 4. PP. 364.

³ Fadeeva I.A. The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the Spanish economy and the Basque disintegration manifestations in the north of the country // *Society: Politics, Economics, Law*. 2021. № 8(97). P. 43.

⁴ Keating M., Bray Z. Renegotiating sovereignty... P. 364.

⁵ Ibid.

with Spain" ¹. Taking into account the results of the research of Khenkin and Samsonkina, Seregin notes that "by no means all Basques take nationalist positions; there is no direct connection between a person's self-identification and his political orientations" ².

The contribution to the academic discussion about the nature of Basque nationalism was made by Kozhanovsky. He clarified whether the "Basque conflict" was ethnic or territorial in nature ³. The author came to the conclusion that the group identification of the Basques "is based not on ethnic, but on territorial criteria" and this is the main factor in the social and political processes in the region, including the pro-independence movement ⁴.

The role of academic studies of the Basque language in the development of Basque nationalism was studied by Kyrchanoff. He concludes that in Basque nationalism we evidence "a symbiosis between the nationalist imagination based on the ethnic paradigm and academic studies" ⁵. The researcher believes that "modernists standardized the Basque language, turning it into a factor in the visualization of ethnicity and identity, ... the supporters of continuity historicized the ethnic paradigm of the Basque political imagination, supporting to increase the symbolic prestige of membership in the Basque civic nation" ⁶. This study demonstrates a necessity for a more thorough study of the role of the linguistic factor in the development of the Basque nationalist movement.

Summarizing the results of studies on the features of the centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country, we can point out two main approaches to this problem: the dynamics of relations between the center and this region in different historical periods and the evolution of Basque nationalism as the form that centrifugal tendencies take.

4. This group consists of research on centrifugal tendencies and nationalism in different autonomous communities of Spain, in other regions of the EU Member States and outside the EU. Academic literature inside of this group can be divided into: 1). Academic literature on the history and current stage of development of self-government institutions and nationalist movements in certain regions of Spain; 2). works in which the Basque Country is compared on this subject with other regions of Spain, primarily with Catalonia; 3). literature comparing Basque nationalism with other non-Spanish cases.

The projects of reforming the Statutes of Autonomies at the beginning of the XXIst century, the increase in the number of terrorist attacks led by ETA and the referendum on the

¹ Seregin A.V. The first volume of a new series "The scientific school of MGIMO" // MGIMO Review of International Relations. 2011. №5(20). P. 277-278.

² Ibid. P. 278.

³ Kozhanovsky A.N. «The Basque Question»... P. 110.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Kyrchanoff M.W. (Non)academic linguistic theories as a development factor of Basque ethnic nationalism (Basque-Iberian and Vasconic hypotheses) // Modern Studies of Social Issues. 2020. Vol. 12. № 1. P. 79.

⁶ Ibid.

independence of Catalonia result in the emergence of numerous works concerning centrifugal tendencies in the Spanish regions. The discussion on these issues was especially active at the level of expert community. The examples are the expert discussions within the Elcano Royal Institute for International and Strategic Studies, the Barcelona Center for International Affairs (CIDOB). Elcano Royal Institute experts revealed the consequences of the dissolution of the terrorist organization ETA, the attitude of the center and Catalonia towards the crisis management associated with the pro-independence movement, as well as the self-determination of Catalonia and Basque Country.

According to Chislett, Emeritus Senior Research Fellow at the Elcano Royal Institute, we are witnessing discontent that has gripped a number of regions in Europe, such as Scotland and Catalonia ¹. The Catalan and Scottish experiences of the pro-independence movements have similarities. However, this does not mean that they can be paralleled, as usually the Catalan separatists would like to justify a Scottish-style referendum ². He also highlighted on the Basque Country case that the dissolution of ETA did not end the conflict between Basque nationalism and central governments of Spain and France, since the conflict did not begin with ETA and cannot end with its dissolution³.

Analysts of the Barcelona Center for International Affairs (CIDOB) consider the Catalan crisis through a different lens, i.e., they are finding out what kind of problems of Spanish society it reveals. Badia and Sarsanedas emphasize that the Catalan crisis added an institutional and political aspect to the existing economic and social difficulties, introducing a high level of uncertainty into the Spanish system ⁴.

Thus, experts from the Elcano Royal Institute and the Barcelona Center for International Affairs offer different assessments and views on the problem of pro-independence movement in Spain. While the analysts of the Elcano Royal Institute focus primarily on the ways of resolving the conflict between the center and regions, on the role of the center in this process, the experts of the Barcelona Center for International Affairs explore the elements of the conflict itself and its consequences for the whole country ⁵.

¹ Chislett W. Catalonia is not Scotland, despite appearances // Real Instituto Elcano [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.realinstitutoelcano.org/en/blog/catalonia-is-not-scotland-despite-appearances/> (accessed: 01.05.2023).

² Ibid.

³ Chislett W. Basque terrorist group ETA disbands after 60 years // Real Instituto Elcano [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.realinstitutoelcano.org/en/blog/basque-terrorist-group-eta-disbands-after-60-years/> (accessed: 01.05.2023).

⁴ Badia F., Sarsanedas O. Spain's territorial tensions: a turning point? // CIDOB. [Electronic resource]. URL: [https://www.cidob.org/articulos/spain_in_focus/october_2012/spain_s_territorial_tensions_a_turning_point/\(language\)/eng-US](https://www.cidob.org/articulos/spain_in_focus/october_2012/spain_s_territorial_tensions_a_turning_point/(language)/eng-US) (accessed: 01.05.2023).

⁵ Please see in more details: Catalonia vs. Spain: selected articles from the international press // CIDOB. [Electronic resource]. URL: [https://www.cidob.org/articulos/spain_in_focus/october_2012/catalonia_vs_spain_selected_articles_from_the_international_press/\(language\)/eng-US](https://www.cidob.org/articulos/spain_in_focus/october_2012/catalonia_vs_spain_selected_articles_from_the_international_press/(language)/eng-US) (accessed: 01.05.2023).

The process of reforming the Statutes of Autonomy at the beginning of the 21st century led to the emergence of a group of academic papers devoted to the nationalist movements in Spain of this period. Here we observe different approaches to the problem among researchers of various disciplines. From a historical point of view, the study of the origins of Catalan nationalism was carried out by Gibernau, who traced its roots to Franco's dictatorship. She revealed the reasons for its transition to separatist positions, associated with the rise of the new Catalan secessionist movement "bottom up" ¹. The author noted among the key reasons for this rise: significant editing of the updated draft of the Statute of Autonomy of Catalonia by the Constitutional Court of Spain. Among the Russian authors, speaking about the reasons for the increase in the level of radical sentiments in Catalan society Krivushin notes: "The actions of Madrid step by step radicalized nationalists moods in Catalan society – from the decision of the Constitutional Court of Spain on the new Statute of Autonomy in 2010 to the ban on holding a referendum on self-determination of the region" ².

The problem of radical nationalism in Spanish society is usually associated with the Basque Country and the terrorist organization ETA ³, but political processes in Catalonia remained out of public attention for a long time ⁴. Orlov drew attention to how deftly the Catalan nationalists (for example, within the "Together for Yes" coalition) used arguments against the policies of the central government and how the center was unable to offer a convincing "patriotic package" of the idea of territorial-political unity to voters ⁵. It was the Catalan nationalist movement that radicalized to a greater extent than the Basque one, that resulted in Catalan independence referendum in 2017.

Growth in the level of support for nationalist parties in the 2010s in Catalonia, the Basque Country and Galicia has led to an increase in the number of academic papers devoted to the electoral strategies and the political behavior of regional elites. The researchers noted that in Spain the specifics of the democratic electoral legislation adopted after 1975, primarily the introduction of a proportional voting system based on party lists, contributed to the formation of politically strong regional party elites. In the absence of an absolute majority in the Congress of Deputies of Spain, the winning party in the parliamentary elections would depend on the support of the regional parties to gain executive power. In a coalition with smaller, but quite influential regional parties,

¹ Guibernau M. Secessionism in Catalonia... P. 368.

² Krivushin I.V. "We are a nation. We decide": Catalan separatism at the beginning of the XXIst century // Modern and Current History Journal. 2018. №1. P. 120.

³ Announced a "definitive cessation of its armed activity" in 2011 and self-dissolution in 2018.

⁴ Orlov A.A. Nationalism in Catalonia as a risk factor for the integrity of Spain // Observer. 2010. №11. P. 109.

⁵ Orlov A.A. Catalan Rift: Confrontation Between Supporters and Opponents of Independence // Observer. 2016. №1. P. 99.

a large party got the opportunity to form a government. This led to the formation of a two-party system from 1977 to 2015 ¹.

In recent years, more researchers have begun to study the electoral strategies of the Catalan parties, as well as the political behavior of the regional elites. Sanjaume-Calvet and Riera-Gil studied the pre-election party programs in Catalonia in order to figure out the peculiarities of the "ethnic issue" in their political agenda ². The problem of polarization of the Catalan elites on the "center-periphery" issues was studied by Rodríguez-Teruel and Barrio. Among other things, they analyzed the rapid growth of support for independence in Catalonia due to the intensification of party competition and introduced the concept of "centrifugal party strategies" ³. Muñoz considered the Catalan case from a different point of view: he studied the relations between the incomes of the population and the level of support for independence ⁴. Rodon and Amat depicted the problem of institutional obligations on Catalan case. They highlighted that "federal contracts and credible agreements respected by all parties are important tools for understanding the decision-making process at the regional level" ⁵.

Considerable attention in the academic literature is paid to the history and the current stage of development of nationalist movements in the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia and, to a lesser extent, in Valencia. The main stages in the development of nationalism in the Basque Country and Catalonia were identified by the sociologist Medrano in "Divided Nations: Class, Politics, and Nationalism in the Basque Country and Catalonia". The author offered an explanation for the differences in the evolution of the Basque and Catalan nationalist movements ⁶. The key research question for Medrano was why the Basque and Catalan nationalist movements developed as two different forms of regional nationalism. He demonstrated that the answer to this question lies beyond the generalizations found in monodisciplinary research. The answer can only be found by taking into account the interaction between socio-economic, political and historical processes. For example, Medrano concludes that the different patterns of industrialization in Catalonia and the Basque Country contributed to the development of two different nationalist projects ⁷.

¹ Barriocanal J. ¿Qué ha pasado en el 26J? 28.06.2016 // El Mundo. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://www.elmundo.es/grafico/espana/2016/06/26/576eccd6ce5fdeaed2a8b457e.html> (accessed: 05.08.2021)

² Sanjaume-Calvet M., Riera-Gil E. Languages, secessionism and party competition in Catalonia... P. 85.

³ Rodríguez-Teruel J., Barrio A. The Asymmetrical Effect of Polarization... P. 412.

⁴ Muñoz J. The Catalan Syndrome? Revisiting... P. 376.

⁵ Amat F., Rodon T. Institutional commitment... P. 439.

⁶ Medrano J. D. *Divided Nations: Class, Politics, And Nationalism In The Basque Country And Catalonia*. Ithaca (NY): Cornell University Press, 1995. P. 5.

⁷ *Ibid.* P. 43.

Medrano also argued that the nationalist movements in both the Basque Country and Catalonia, although embedded in the context of the political development of Spain, differ in their goals, strategies, electoral base and degree of success in mobilizing public opinion ¹.

Various factors that influenced the development of nationalist movements in the Basque Country, Catalonia and Galicia, as well as the cultural particularism in these regions, were also studied by Fusi Aizpúrua ². Russian researchers also investigated the differences between Basque and Catalan nationalists. Filatov highlighted despite the similar context of origin, the Basque and Catalan nationalist movements developed in different ways ³. If the history of Catalan nationalism was dominated by peaceful forms of struggle for self-determination, then the Basque nationalists actively used violent methods of struggle to achieve their goals. Filatov also compared the development of regional nationalist movements in the Basque Country, Catalonia and Galicia at the present stage. He explained why the pro-independence movement was most clearly manifested in Catalonia at the beginning of the XXI century. In particular, he pointed out three factors that led the Catalan political elite to take a course towards the independence: a strong regionalist movement historically, Madrid's refusal to expand autonomy, and a severe economic crisis ⁴. In his opinion, in the Basque Country, despite the historically strong regionalist movement, autonomy was quite wide, and the consequences of the crisis were less severe ⁵. In Galicia, the consequences of the economic crisis were more severe, regionalism was quite strong historically, but there was no strong regional party capable of successful promotion of the nationalist agenda ⁶.

Projects of self-determination of the Basque Country and Catalonia were also considered by Frolova. In her opinion, despite attempts to find the best way to solve the problem of self-determination in Spain, this issue is still far from being resolved. She concludes that the key condition for the project of self-determination to receive the support of Catalans and Basques is the continued membership of these regions in the EU ⁷. This means that an important element in maintaining the unity of Spain is the EU's support for the policy of the center towards the regions. In general, Frolova highlights the transformation of the classical understanding of sovereignty – a

¹ Medrano J. D. *Divided Nations...* P. 5.

² Fusi Aizpúrua J. P. *Hechos diferenciales y particularismo cultural: Cataluña, País Vasco, Galicia // Cuadernos de historia contemporánea*. 1998. № 20. P. 107-115.

³ Filatov G.A. *Basque and Catalan Nationalism: from the Emergence to the Transition // The Journal of Education and Science "ISTORIYA" ("History")*. 2017. Vol. 8. № 10 (64). [Electronic resource] URL: <https://history.jes.su/s207987840001997-5-1/> (accessed: 20.12.2022).

⁴ Filatov G.A. *Catalonia, the Basque Country and Galicia: separatist tendencies in the beginning of the 21st century // World Economy and International Relations*. 2018. 11(62). P. 50.

⁵ *Ibid.*

⁶ *Ibid.*

⁷ Frolova Iu.N. *Catalonia and the Basque Country: the analysis of the main projects of self-determination // Bulletin of Perm University. Political Science*. 2019. T.13. № 1. P. 94.

process that is especially noticeable in the EU countries ¹. In its turn, this factor limits the solution to the problem of the self-determination of the Basques and Catalans in Spain ².

The coordination and interconnectedness of the Basque and Catalan nationalists' actions have been of interest to a number of researchers. The authors give different ideas about the extent to which the actions of regional nationalists can be considered as connected and solidary. On the one hand, Dronova pointed out that the nationalists of the Basque Country called for "synchronization" of actions with the nationalists of Catalonia. In its turn, they could make an effort to achieve a revision of the Spanish Constitution jointly and grant the regions the right to change their status within the state ³. On the other hand, Basmanova and Mussau-Ulianishcheva emphasize that at present time "the events in Catalonia [the Catalan independence referendum] did not affect the situation in the Basque Country" ⁴. The authors cite as evidence the fact that the use of force by Madrid in the resist the Catalan separatists did not cause protests among the Basque society ⁵.

Nowadays the attention of researchers is mainly focused on the reasons for the strengthening of nationalist movements and the peculiarities of the strategies of regional parties. At the same time, less attention is paid to factors contributing to the growth of support for nationalist parties in different regions of Spain.

Despite the fact that researchers were more interested in the development of nationalist movements within the EU Member States at the beginning of the XXI century, there are academic papers devoted to this phenomenon outside the EU. For example, the authors compared the Basque nationalist movement with similar movements in non-European countries. Gudzhatullaev examines the factors of ethno-political conflicts on Kurdistan, the Basque Country and Nagorno-Karabakh cases. The researcher combines these cases into one category, explaining this choice by the fact that violent and armed methods of struggle for independence were used in all of them. Gudzhatullaev identifies four main factors in the development of "ethno-political conflicts: their civilizational origin, processes in world politics, assimilation policy towards ethnic minorities, economic disproportions in the region" ⁶.

¹ Frolova Iu.N. The issues of sovereignty and national self-determination in Spain in the context of globalization // *International relations*. 2017. No. 3. P. 27.

² Ibid.

³ Dronova S.Yu. Catalonia and the Basque Country - two models of Spanish separatism // *Society: Politics, Economics, Law*. 2019. № 2 (67). P. 12.

⁴ Basmanova A.A., Mussau-Ulianishcheva E.V. Separatism in the Basque country // *Bulletin of Peoples' Friendship University of Russia. Series, Political science*. 2018. Vol. 20. № 3. P. 371..

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Gudzhatullaev R.A. Factors of separatist ethno-political conflicts on the examples of Kurdistan, Basque Country, and Nagorno-Karabakh // *Bulletin of Perm University. Political Science*. 2015. № 1(29). P. 123.

The importance of the experience of nationalist movements in other countries, both within the EU and outside the EU, was mentioned in an interview given by the Spanish researcher Fabiola Mota Consejero. In particular, she noted: “The 2014 Scottish referendum served as an incentive for Catalan nationalists to demand a referendum following the example of Scotland. Obviously, Quebec has also been an inspiration to the Catalan nationalists with their demand for a referendum. At the same time, secessionist opposition to Basque parties such as Bildu was influenced by Northern Ireland heavily. I think that the agreements, the negotiations that served to resolve the conflict in Northern Ireland, stimulated or helped to start a similar process in Spain”¹.

Another important layer of academic literature is PhD research on similar topics. Belova examines the features of the separatism in various regions of Spain on the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia cases from 1975 to 2004. The author came to a number of conclusions, firstly, the main territorial problems of Spain are separatism, radical nationalism and the lack of an optimal formula for resolving national-regional contradictions ², secondly, the concept of "separatism" is perceived in different regions of Spain in different ways depending on cultural traditions ³. Thirdly, the separatist movement in Spain can arise both in regions with high rates of socio-economic growth (Basque Country and Catalonia) and in regions with a lower standard of living (Galicia) ⁴.

Another research is a thesis about sovereignty and national self-determination in Spain made by Frolova. In particular, she has explored relevant concepts of sovereignty and self-determination in international relations theory. The author comes to the conclusion that an important factor in resolving the conflict caused by the desire for the independence of Catalonia and the Basque Country is the policy of the central government of Spain ⁵. She also notes that today new participants are included in the number of actors in international relations, which significantly complicates the solution of issues that could previously be resolved at the state level ⁶. Therefore, the conflict of the center with Catalonia and the Basque Country cannot be resolved exclusively within Spain, since the problem has acquired a pan-European significance ⁷.

The PhD thesis of Kutuzova depicts the role and place of moderate regional nationalist parties in the political system of Spain. She highlights the features of their development in the first half of the 20th century and after the beginning of the democratic transition in Spain. She also

¹ Fabiola Mota Consejero, Lecturer, Autonomous University of Madrid, Department of Political Science and International Relations, Madrid, Spain, November 16, 2021 (Expert survey time: 40 min.)

² Belova K.A. Features of the development of separatism in Spain after the dictatorship of F. Franco (Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia): PhD theses. M. 2004. P.25.

³ Ibid.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Frolova Iu.N. The issues of sovereignty and national self-determination in Spain in the context of globalization: PhD theses. Saint Petersburg. 2017. P.19.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Ibid.

analyzed the features of the Spanish party system and the forms of inter-party cooperation of the nationalists ¹. Finally, Kutuzova studied the pre-electoral documents of the main regional nationalist parties in Spain – Convergence and Union, BNP and GNB, and their election campaigns for 2003 and 2005 ².

Features of the development of separatism in Spain on the Basque Country and Catalonia cases in the second half XX and the beginning of XXI centuries studied by Fonseca. The author identified the factors of separatism in this country at the end of the XXth – beginning of the XXIst centuries and characteristics of secessionist sentiments and movements in Catalonia and the Basque Country ³. She also investigated the tools used by the Spanish authorities to counter regional separatism. The author revealed the following factors that fueled separatism: ethno-confessional, socio-economic, political, historical, demographic, socio-cultural and geopolitical. The author claimed the roots of Basque separatism were laid in the ethno-cultural originality and geographical isolation of the region ⁴.

In more detail, the economic factor of regional separatism in Spain was considered in the PhD thesis of Zaripova. The author came to the conclusion that "the economic factor acts as a trigger for regional separatism in Spain, provided that there is a regional identity that prevails over the national self-consciousness, regional linguistic identity and asymmetry in the political powers of the autonomous communities" ⁵. At the same time, Zaripova highlighted that the foral regime in the Basque Country helps to maintain the territorial and political status quo ⁶.

It is also worth mentioning the thesis on modern relations between the central and regional authorities of Spain made by Dronova. She systematized the main approaches to the interpretation of separatism and secession, characteristic of the Spanish political and legal discourse, and proposed to introduce the notion independitism into domestic academic discourse ⁷. The author revealed the conditions that determine the configuration of the modern relations "region-center" in Spain, and also determined the features of the influence of historical, ethno-confessional, linguistic and economic factors on the Spanish regional policy ⁸. She also identified the main ways to deal with regional problems in Spain and assessed the impact of the EU on the relations between regions and center in Spain through the creation of Euroregions and macroregions. Thus, she added

¹ Kutuzova V.M. The role of moderate nationalist parties in the political system of Spain: PhD theses. M. 2007. P. 19.

² Ibid. P. 20.

³ Fonseca N.J. Features of separatism in Spain at the end of the XXth - beginning of the XXIst centuries: on the Basque country and Catalonia: PhD theses. M. 2017. P.11.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Zaripova A.R. The economic factor of regional separatism in Spain: PhD theses. Kazan. 2019. P. 12.

⁶ Ibid. P. 20.

⁷ Dronova S.Yu. Modern relations between the central and regional authorities of Spain: problems and mechanisms of regulation: PhD theses. M. 2020. P. 8.

⁸ Ibid.

a new factor to those usually considered in academic debates about the nature of relations between center and regions ¹.

To conclude, researchers of different disciplines turned to certain aspects of the mentioned topic. Their conceptual findings were applied by the author in this thesis. At the same time, we observe a differentiation of opinions, in particular, a difference in the findings on the current state and ways of resolving the Basque and Catalan conflicts. There is also some disunity in the assessment of the most important factors that form centrifugal tendencies in modern Spain. It seems important to the author of the thesis to propose a systematization of the factors of centrifugal tendencies in Spain, to compare domestic political, socio-economic factors and factors of the international affairs. Only few studies provide a comprehensive analysis of centrifugal tendencies in Basque, Catalan, Galician and Valencian societies, taking into account the internal and external factors that shape these centrifugal tendencies. This is significant to compare centrifugal tendencies both in the regions where these tendencies are most pronounced such as the Basque Country and Catalonia, and in the other regions such as Galicia and Valencia. Our study seeks to fill this gap and contribute to the theoretical understanding of centrifugal tendencies in Spain.

Research question

What factors contribute to the fact that in some regions of Spain centrifugal tendencies are intensifying, while in others, on the contrary, weakening?

Aims and objectives

The aim of this study is to determine the factors fueling centrifugal tendencies in the regions of Spain.

To achieve this aim, the following tasks were set:

- 1) To find out the historical roots of modern centrifugal tendencies in Spain and identify the historical events that contributed to them;
- 2) To determine the features of the configuration of relations between the center and regions in Spain and the specifics of the Basque Country in the “States of Autonomies”;
- 3) To find out the historical origins of centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country;
- 4) To identify the main features and characteristics of the centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country after the beginning of the democratic transition in Spain;
- 5) To identify the “subjective” and “objective” factors fueling centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country from 2009 to July 2020 (after the beginning of COVID-19 pandemic);

¹ Dronova S.Yu. Modern relations between the central and regional authorities of Spain... P. 8.

6) To show the main and specific features of centrifugal tendencies in Spain on the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia cases from 2009 to July 2020;

7) To demonstrate the historical, socio-economic, cultural-linguistic and party-political factors in the development of centrifugal tendencies in Spain using the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia cases from 2009 to July 2020.

In the thesis, we rely on the definition of "regionalized" proposed by Bullman: "regionalized unitary states" are characterized by the existence of a directly-elected tier of regional government with constitutional status, wide-ranging autonomy and legislative powers.¹ "Regionalized unitary states" differ from devolving unitary states in that they are characterized by a wider degree of autonomy. In the category of "regionalized unitary states" the author included Spain, Italy and Belgium². According to Bullman's classification, these countries have advanced the farthest along the path of regional decentralization among the unitary states of the EU. Bullman's contribution was that he proposed a de jure typology of unitary states, designed to rethink their difference from federations³. Volkova notes that Russian authors also referred Spain "to the category of regionalist states, which distinguishes it from unitary centralized states, but does not achieve the level of independence of subjects of the federation"⁴. However, Bullman's typology today can be rethought, as evidenced by the example of the United Kingdom. From the moment when Bullman proposed his typology in 1996, the internal political situation in the United Kingdom has changed significantly. Today it can also be considered a "regionalist state", while before the start of the devolution at the end of XX and the beginning of XXI centuries it was a classic unitary state⁵.

Hypotheses

The hypothesis of this study is the following: centrifugal tendencies are an integral part of the history of Spain, but in recent decades the ratio of the factors that determine them and the mechanisms that form them have changed. The most important factors today are the specifics of territorial and political model of Spain that emerged in the late 1970s and early 1980s, the strengthening of regional identities, the deterioration of the socio-economic situation. The ability of regional nationalist parties to present themselves to the electorate as the most consistent defenders of the region's interests and the most effective managers (if they came to power) also played a significant role, which allowed them to fill the political and ideological vacuum resulting

¹ Bullmann U. The politics of the third level // Regional & Federal Studies. 2007. № 6(2). P. 5.

² Ibid. P. 5.

³ Ibid.

⁴ Volkova G. I. Spain: State of Autonomies... P. 44.

⁵ Garnett M., Dorey P., Lynch P. Exploring British Politics. New York: Routledge, 2020. P. 10.

from the weakening of institutional and socio-psychological ties between center and regions and the discrediting of national political parties and coalitions in public opinion.

Scope and limitations of research

The research covers the period from the beginning of the global financial and economic crisis of 2008-2009 until 2021, i.e., until the last national and regional elections in Spain, primarily in Valencia in 2019, in the Basque Country and Galicia in 2020 and in Catalonia in 2021. This time frame is chosen due to the fact that in the period after the financial and economic crisis, there has been an increase in centrifugal tendencies in Spain (increase in support for the left-wing radical nationalist movement in the Basque Country, the transition of moderate Catalan nationalists to separatist positions and Catalanian independence referendums in Catalonia in 2014 and 2017, the strengthening of the electoral positions of nationalists in Galicia and Valencia).

In some parts of the research, a more detailed historical analysis is carried out, which requires an appeal to the events of an earlier time period, primarily to the period from 1975 to the financial crisis of 2008-2009. Since it is impossible to understand the nature of centrifugal tendencies in the political development of Spain after 2010 without understanding the peculiarities of the “State of Autonomy” evolution, the specifics of the relations between the center and the regions and the features of the development of regional nationalist movements.

Methodology and methods

The methodology of the research is based on the principles of scientific objectivity, historicism and consistency. The principle of historicism made it possible to study the current stage of development of centrifugal tendencies in Spain in a historical context and present them not only in a synchronic, but also in a diachronic perspective. The principle of consistency allows to understand the centrifugal tendencies in various regions of Spain as a reflection of patterns that are characteristic both for Spain as a whole and for the EU regionalist states as such.

The dissertation is made on the basis of interdisciplinary research methods, which allow to depict the peculiarities of centrifugal tendencies from different approaches. These are the methods of historical research, which make it possible to consider the centrifugal tendencies in Spain in their contradictory dialectical unity.

Firstly, the research relies on a chronological approach, i.e., description of phenomena and events in time to another point in time, as well as a systematic approach that makes it possible to identify the factors of centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country based via the entire complex of factors.

Secondly, a comparative-historical method that allows to compare the historical dynamics of centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country with the historical dynamics of centrifugal tendencies in other regions of Spain, i.e., Catalonia, Galicia, Valencia, and to identify the general

and particular in the historical development of such tendencies in these regions. This method allows us to understand the phenomenon of centrifugal tendencies in Spain in a diachronic perspective, that is, in their temporal mobility and variability.

Thirdly, the historical-genetic method allows to establish causal relationships between ongoing events and phenomena in time. This method helps to reveal continuity in the historical development of centrifugal tendencies in Spain in connection with the changing domestic political situation.

Fourthly, in addition to the methods of historical research, we use the quantitative measurements, in particular, a secondary analysis of sociological data. On the basis of quantitative indicators (electoral statistics and sociological survey data, we identify the level of support for the pro-independence ideas of the region and the expansion of its autonomy in the Basque Country and compare the data with Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia cases. Additionally, the method of ideal types by Weber is chosen. The reason for choosing it is that the areas of reality we are studying are extremely complex and multidimensional. Therefore, it is necessary to apply a special construction that allow at least to streamline reality. The ideal types of Weber became the theoretical basis for compiling sociological portraits. Our research based on identifying the social composition of the nationalist parties electorate and determining the proportion of those who voted for them among different demographic, socio-economic, political-ideological and linguistic groups. The data collection on the composition of the nationalist parties' electorate and the reconstruction of the sociological portrait of the voter – supporter of the nationalists – in this research were carried out on the basis of pre-election polls conducted by the Centre of Sociological Research (CSR) in Spain from 2009 to June 2020. Polls were conducted in the regions of Spain among citizens eligible to vote in autonomous elections.

Selection of empirical data

The study's source base encompasses eight main groups of sources, including the following ones.

The first group includes legal documents and sources of Spanish law. In this category we include the Spanish Constitution of 1978 ¹, the Statutes of Autonomy such as the Statute of

¹ Constitución española // Boletín Oficial. Del Estado. 1978. T. 311. [Electronic resource]. URL: http://www.fonz.es/pub/documentos/documentos_Documento1_594b1f5b.pdf (accessed: 09.12.2021)

Gernika¹, the Statute of Sau², the Statute of Galicia³, the Statute of Valencia⁴, the Reform of the Statute of Autonomy of Catalonia⁵, the Reform of the Statute of Autonomy of Valencia⁶. The Spanish Constitution of 1978 allows to reveal the peculiarities of the legal norms that different Spanish regions can use to protect and promote their interests within the “State of Autonomies” and what legal opportunities they are deprived of. In this context, it allows to depict how the regions' strategy can be used in order to lobby their demands at the national level and level of the EU institutions. The Statutes of Autonomy makes it possible to understand what powers Autonomous communities currently have. Also, a comparison of the Statutes demonstrates a clear differences in the scope of competences in different regions.

The second group includes official documents, but not necessarily of a regulatory nature – strategies and plans, press releases, statements by officials from the official portals of the institutions of the European Union and departments of Spain: the official website of the European Union⁷ and the European Commission⁸, resources from the official website of the Committee of the Regions⁹, materials from the websites of regional governments of Spain¹⁰.

¹ Ley Orgánica 3/1979, de 18 de diciembre, de Estatuto de Autonomía para el País Vasco // Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/1979/BOE-A-1979-30177-consolidado.pdf> (accessed: 03.06.2022).

² Ley Orgánica 4/1979, de 18 de diciembre, de Estatuto de Autonomía de Cataluña // Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.boe.es/eli/es/lo/1979/12/18/4> (accessed: 03.06.2022).

³ Ley Orgánica 1/1981, de 6 de abril, de Estatuto de Autonomía para Galicia // Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/act.php?id=BOE-A-1981-9564> (accessed: 03.06.2022).

⁴ Ley Orgánica 5/1982, de 1 de julio, de Estatuto de Autonomía de la Comunidad Valenciana // Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/act.php?id=BOE-A-1982-17235> (accessed: 03.06.2022).

⁵ Ley Orgánica 6/2006, de 19 de julio, de reforma del Estatuto de Autonomía de Cataluña // Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/act.php?id=BOE-A-2006-13087> (accessed: 26.09.2022).

⁶ Ley Orgánica 1/2006, de 10 de abril, de Reforma de la Ley Orgánica 5/1982, de 1 de julio, de Estatuto de Autonomía de la Comunidad Valenciana // Gobierno de España [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/doc.php?id=BOE-A-2006-6472> (accessed: 17.08.2022).

⁷ Official website of the European Union. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://europa.eu> (accessed: 16.12.2021)

⁸ Official website of the European Commission. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://ec.europa.eu> (accessed: 16.12.2021)

⁹ The official website of European Committee of the Regions. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://cor.europa.eu> (accessed: 16.12.2021)

¹⁰ Generalitat Valenciana. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.gva.es/va/inicio/presentacion> (accessed: 16.12.2021);

Gobierno Vasco. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.euskadi.eus/inicio/> (accessed: 16.12.2021);

Xunta de Galicia. [Electronic resource] URL: <https://www.xunta.gal/portada> (accessed: 16.12.2021);

Generalitat de Catalunya. [Electronic resource] URL: <https://fciprianogarcia.ccoo.cat/ceres/documents/convenis/0000019806.pdf> (accessed: 16.12.2021)

The third group includes party programs, for instance, Basque Nationalist Party ¹, Bildu ², Republican Left of Catalonia ³, Together for Catalonia ⁴, Popular Unity Candidacy ⁵, Galician Nationalist Bloc ⁶, Compromise Coalition ⁷. The programs of the parties allow us to trace their position on the independence and self-government, as well as to find out which dimension – territorial, socio-economic, cultural and linguistic – is of greater importance.

The fourth group includes economic and socio-economic statistics. In particular, Datosmacro⁸ and EpData ⁹ provide data that allows to track how the main macroeconomic indicators have changed in recent years both in Spain and in its regions. These databases contain data on GDP per capita of the Spanish Autonomous communities and on the dynamics of unemployment level and level of poverty in the country. This allows a better understanding of the role of the socio-economic factor in the development of centrifugal tendencies in Spain.

The fifth group encompasses the results of sociological opinion polls: Spanish Center for Sociological Research (CIS) ¹⁰, Eurobarometer ¹¹, Elcano Royal Institute for International and Strategic Studies ¹². CIS conducts national and regional surveys (in 17 Spanish autonomous communities) both before and after elections. The Centre presents their reports structured according to various parameters (sex, age, education, etc.). In our research, CIS database allows to determine the sociological profile of both the supporters of independence and greater autonomy,

¹ Programa 2016-2020. Eraiki Euskadi. Euskadi mira al futuro // EAJ-PNV [Electronic resource]. URL: https://www.eaj-pnv.eus/adjuntos/pnvDocumentos/18289_archivo.pdf (accessed: 18.07.2022); Programa electoral elecciones al parlamento Vasco 2020-2024 // EAJ-PNV [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.eaj-pnv.eus/es/adjuntos-documentos/19724/pdf/programa-electoral-elecciones-al-parlamento-vasco> (accessed: 09.12.2021);

Programa electoral elecciones generales 2019-2023 // EAJ-PNV [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.eaj-pnv.eus/es/adjuntos-documentos/19437/pdf/programa-electoral-elecciones-generales-2019-10n> (accessed: 09.12.2021);

² Programa electoral de EH Bildu 2016 a las elecciones 26-J. Vamos a crear oportunidades // EH Bildu [Electronic resource]. URL: https://manifiesto-project.wzb.eu/down/originals/2017-1/33095_2016.pdf (accessed: 18.07.2022); Compromiso político de EH Bildu // EH Bildu. P. 2. [Electronic resource]. URL: https://ehbildu.eus/herriak/Erabaki-BAIETZ/dokumentuak/EHBildu_CompromisoPoliticoSocial.pdf (accessed: 18.07.2022).

³ Programa electoral. Elecciones al Parlament de Catalunya 2021 // Esquerra Republicana [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.esquerra.cat/alcostatdelagent/p2021-programa.pdf> (accessed: 09.12.2021).

⁴ Programa electoral. Elecciones al Parlament de Catalunya 2021 // Junts per Catalunya [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://junts.cat/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/PROGRAMA-ELECTORAL-JUNTS.pdf> (accessed: 09.12.2021).

⁵ Programa Polític Febrer 2021. Un nou cicle per Guanyar // CUP [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://perguanyar.cat/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/Programa.pdf> (accessed: 09.12.2022).

⁶ Programa electoral do BNG Galegas Xullo 2020 // Bloque Nacionalista Galego [Electronic resource]. URL: https://www.bng.gal/media/bnggaliza/files/2020/06/15/programa_galegas_2020.pdf (accessed: 09.12.2021).

⁷ Programa electoral elecciones Valencia // Compromís. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://n10.compromis.net/programa/> (accessed: 09.12.2021).

⁸ Expansion. Datosmacro.com. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://datosmacro.expansion.com/pib/espana-comunidades-autonomas> (accessed: 27.12.2021)

⁹ EpData. [Electronic resource]. (Población: inmigrantes, emigrantes y otros datos sobre los habitantes de cada comunidad autónoma). [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.epdata.es> (accessed: 27.12.2021)

¹⁰ Centro de los Investigaciones Sociológicas. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://www.cis.es> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

¹¹ Eurobarometer. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://ec.europa.eu/commfrontoffice/publicopinion/index.cfm> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

¹² Real Instituto Elcano. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://www.realinstitutoelcano.org/> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

and supporters of nationalist parties and coalitions in different autonomous communities (in the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia). Eurobarometer reveals the perception by the population of the Spanish Autonomous Communities of the policy pursued by the EU ¹. In particular, it is interesting for our research to see the results of surveys in which citizens evaluate the effectiveness of decision-making process in different levels (supranational, national and subnational).

The sixth group includes electoral statistics. In particular, the following sources are of interest – the election results given by the official websites of the Basque government ², the Catalan government ³, the Valencian government ⁴ (regional elections), the Galician government ⁵, the Central Electoral Junta ⁶ (results of national elections), the information about the results of the elections in El País ⁷.

Periodical literature belongs to the seventh group. These are the four most popular Spanish newspapers - El Mundo (liberal, centre-right) ⁸, El País (social democratic and social liberal) ⁹ and ABC (conservative, monarchist, catholic) ¹⁰. We also were interested in analytical editions, such as El Confidencial (liberal) ¹¹. In addition, we relied on the main regional newspapers – La Vanguardia (fourth most popular in Spain) ¹², El Periódico (fifth most popular) ¹³ and ARA in Catalonia ¹⁴, EITB ¹⁵ and El Diario Vasco ¹⁶ in the Basque Country, La Voz de Galicia ¹⁷, the most readable newspaper in Galicia (and the 8th most popular in Spain), and Faro de Vigo, the oldest Spanish newspaper and the most popular in Southern Galicia ¹⁸. Spanish periodical literature helps us to identify current trends in the development of the nationalist movements in Spain, to

¹ Citizens' awareness and perceptions of EU Regional Policy. June 2019 // Eurobarometer 480. Results for Spain. [Electronic resource]. URL: https://search.gesis.org/research_data/ZA7577(accessed: 27.12.2021).

² Resultados electorales // Gobierno Vasco [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.euskadi.eus/ab12aAREWar/resultado/maint> (accessed: 16.10.2022).

³ Eleccions al Parlament de Catalunya // Generalitat de Catalunya [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://resultats.dadeselectorals.gencat.cat/#/> (accessed: 16.10.2022).

⁴ Corts Valencianes [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.cortsvalencianes.es/> (accessed: 16.10.2022)

⁵ Elecciones 2020 Parlamento de Galicia. Resultados definitivos // Xunta de Galicia [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://resultados2020.xunta.gal/resultados/0/galicia> (accessed: 16.10.2022); Junta Electoral De Galicia // Parlamento de Galicia [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.es.parlamentodegalicia.es/XuntaElectoral> (accessed: 16.10.2022).

⁶ Junta Electoral Central [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://www.juntaelectoralcentral.es/cs/jec/elecciones> (accessed: 16.10.2022).

⁷ El País. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://elpais.com> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

⁸ El Mundo. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://elmundo.com> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

⁹ El País. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://elpais.com> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

¹⁰ ABC. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.abc.es> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

¹¹ El Confidencial. [Electronic resource]. URL: <http://www.elconfidencial.com/> (accessed: 27.12.2021).

¹² La Vanguardia. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.lavanguardia.com> (accessed: 14.01.2022).

¹³ El Periódico de Catalunya. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.elperiodico.com/es/> (accessed: 14.01.2022).

¹⁴ Diari ARA. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.ara.cat> (accessed: 14.01.2022).

¹⁵ EITB Radio Televisión Pública Vasca. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.eitb.eus/es/tag/comunidad-autonoma-vasca/> (accessed: 14.01.2022).

¹⁶ El Diario Vasco. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.diariovasco.com> (accessed: 14.01.2022).

¹⁷ La Voz de Galicia. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.lavozdegalicia.es> (accessed: 20.01.2022).

¹⁸ Faro de Vigo. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.farodevigo.es> (accessed: 20.01.2022).

study the statements of the nationalist parties' leaders, to find out the position of parties and movements on a number of important political, cultural and socio-economic issues.

Original scholarly research contributions to the subject field

Specific elements of scientific novelty include:

1) The factors of centrifugal tendencies in Spain are systematized. A comparison of domestic political, socio-economic and international environment factors has been made and it has been determined which combination of factors currently has a greater influence on centrifugal tendencies in Spain.

2) A comparative historical analysis of centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country and in other autonomous communities of Spain – Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia were carried out. In other studies, the case of Galicia has already been the focus of attention of researchers, but only once (in 2004), the case of Valencia has not yet become the subject of serious academic analysis. A number of scientists have studied separately the cases of the Basque Country and Catalonia, however, a comprehensive comparison of centrifugal tendencies in four regions of Spain – the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia – has not yet been carried out. Some PhD theses, for example, by Zaripova, covers all autonomous communities, but by virtue of this very fact, she is forced to confine themselves to some particular aspect of the problem or the analysis of some individual factor.

3) The concept of centrifugal tendencies is comprehended on the Spanish case. As a result, the concept of "centrifugal tendencies" used in academic discourse has been supplemented. The definition we propose is complementary to those that existed earlier in the academic discussion, and does not negate them. To study the territorial and political features of Spain, in our opinion, the concept of "centrifugal tendencies" is most relevant.

4) The sociological profile of a supporter of independence and expansion of autonomy in various autonomous communities of Spain, as well as a voter of nationalist parties in the demographic, socio-economic, political-ideological and cultural-linguistic dimensions has been reconstructed. The profile is necessary to analyze the factors of centrifugal tendencies in the Spanish territorial-political system and allows you to identify these factors. The sociological portrait of supporters of independence and the expansion of autonomy and voters of the nationalist parties of the Basque Country, Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia is being carried out for the first time.

5) Despite the fact that the question of the Basque nationalism evolution before 1975, was considered in some domestic PhD theses ¹, none of their authors made centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country as the main subject of their analysis.

The structure of the research

The first chapter of the PhD thesis examines the stages of development of the territorial and political structure of Spain before the democratic transition and up to the present. The second chapter of the PhD thesis reveals the role and place of the Basque Country in the territorial and political structure of Spain before and after the democratic transition. The sociological profile of the nationalist parties' voter in the Basque Country is determined, which allows to clarify what features are inherent in the profile of pro-autonomist and pro-separatist supporters. The chapter is also devoted to the analysis of demographic, socio-economic, political, ideological and linguistic factors of centrifugal tendencies in Spain on the Basque Country case. In the third chapter centrifugal tendencies in the Basque Country are compared with centrifugal tendencies in other autonomous communities of Spain: in Catalonia, Galicia and Valencia. As a result, general and specific factors of centrifugal tendencies are revealed. The presented structure of the thesis is fully consistent with the stated aims, allows to achieve the goal of the academic paper and confirm the hypothesis of the PhD thesis.

The summary of the findings and conclusions

The conducted study of the factors of centrifugal tendencies in Spain led to the following conclusions. First, the process of centrifugal and centripetal tendencies in Spain is inherent in the history of this country. Therefore, centrifugal tendencies in Spain are not a completely new phenomenon.

Secondly, according to the Constitution, Spain is not a federal state; this document sets out the mechanisms for the country's federalization and decentralization of political competences. The first institutions of territorial self-government were created even before the Constitution. The regions sought political recognition before their constitutional legitimation. The authors of the Constitution took into account this request from the regions. Thus, the process of creating a Spanish territorial-political model was initiated, which, on the one hand, is democratic, on the other hand, decentralized while maintaining the formally unitary nature of the state.

Thirdly, the peculiarity of the "State of Autonomies" is that from the beginning an asymmetric model was established that determines the modality of the development of relations between the center and the regions. The new Spanish territorial-political model satisfied and stimulated the aspiration of the regions, especially the "historical nationalities" such as Catalonia,

¹ Samsonkina E. S. The Evolution of Basque Nationalism (End of 19th Century - 1975): PhD theses. M. 2004. 272 p.

the Basque Country and Galicia, to assert their "uniqueness" by obtaining a privileged status compared to other territories and establishing special relations with the center.

Fourth, our analysis demonstrates that in the Basque Country the dynamics of separatist and autonomist sentiments do not correspond to the dynamics of electoral support for nationalist parties and coalitions. This is due to the fact that the BNP, which has been in power in the region for more than forty years and is the dominant force in the Basque nationalist camp, has chosen a pragmatic political line, refusing to speed up the struggle for achieving the independence of the region in favor of "knocking out" through negotiations with the center of new political and economic concessions. A pragmatic approach to building a political strategy and abandoning radical demands for independence in the short term in order to protect the interests of the region through reaching compromise agreements with the center allowed the BNP to enlist the support of a part of the electorate that does not share nationalist sentiments.

The results of the research demonstrated that the following should be highlighted as key factors. First, these are the features of the territorial-political model laid down in the 1978 Constitution. The Constitution, in particular, singles out two groups of competences – the exclusive competences of the state and the competences that the state can transfer to autonomous communities. The territorial-political model of Spain and its socio-economic development of the regions are characterized by asymmetry, which feeds centrifugal tendencies. Despite the center's measures to equalize the socio-economic development of the regions, there is still a high level of disproportion in the Spanish territorial development.

Secondly, the factor of the tactics of the nationalist movements and the effectiveness of their policies. In all mentioned cases, we evidence that the success of the nationalist movement largely depends on the tactics of the nationalist forces and their ability to present their “product” in an ideological “package” acceptable to voters. In those regions in which the nationalist parties acted as two flanks and managed to unite different age, educational, socio-economic and political-ideological groups, they achieved the greatest success. It became important to what extent the nationalist forces that came to power are able to present themselves as defenders of the interests of the region as a whole, and not just as those whose goals and activities are focused primarily on supporting traditional regional culture and reviving regional ethnic identity.

Thirdly, the factor of regional identities based on cultural and linguistic features (regional language, bilingualism), cultural traditions and historical memory. During the Franco regime, any manifestations of regional particularism (the use of a regional language, the holding of regional holidays, the promotion of regional culture) were suppressed. During the period of democratic transition, there is a revival of cultural activity in the regions; regional governments, municipalities and public organizations are taking measures to protect and develop the culture and language of

the regional communities. Despite this, the factor of regional identities today does not play a decisive role in the strengthening of centrifugal tendencies. This factor becomes important only in conjunction with a number of other structural and situational factors, such as socio-economic development (in some cases) and the tactics of nationalist movements (in all cases).

Finally, socio-economic factors are most pronounced in the case of the most developed regions, such as the Basque Country and Catalonia. In these regions, the level of separatist sentiment increased with a sharp change in the consumer price index. In regions with a higher level of socio-economic development centrifugal tendencies are stronger, and for less prosperous regions, the opposite is true. This is due to the fact that the latter, faced with socio-economic difficulties, seek to receive support from the center.

The socio-economic factor has an impact on the process of struggle for independence, only in a different capacity. Regional political elites in Catalonia are striving to expand their financial and economic competencies, demanding that the region be given the same tax powers and privileges that the Basque Country has. At the same time, in the Basque Country, despite the high level of financial autonomy and privileges, there is a desire of regional elites to preserve and increase these privileges. That is, the financial and economic inequality of the two most socio-economically developed regions of Spain has become a factor that stimulated centrifugal tendencies.

Statements to be defended

1) The process of centrifugal and centripetal tendencies in Spain is rooted in earlier historical periods. Centrifugal tendencies are not a completely new phenomenon in Spain, the forms of centrifugal tendencies and the factors that fuel them have been changed.

2) Among the key factors of centrifugal tendencies in modern Spain, it is worth highlighting the features of the territorial and political model of Spain, formed during the period of democratic transition after 1975; the factor of tactics and strategy of nationalist parties; the factor of regional identities based on cultural and linguistic features; factor of historical memory; socio-economic factors.

3) Support for centrifugal tendencies comes from certain social groups and is determined by age (younger), level of education (more educated), social status (workers and representatives of higher social status), political and ideological sympathies (more leftist moods) and ethnic identity (stronger regional ethnic and linguistic identification).

4) At the same time, “subjective factors” play a role in the political development of the regions, for example, the ability of nationalist parties to present themselves as the most effective defenders of the region’s interests, and the most skillful managers. At the same time, “objective factors”, primarily the deterioration of the economic situation, lead to an increase in dissatisfaction

with the existing situation and to the search for the political force that can improve this situation. In Spain, the central government is perceived as the culprit of socio-economic troubles, and the parties associated with it, primarily those that were or are in power in Madrid, are losing the support of voters in the regions. The emerging political “vacuum”, which cannot be filled by the central government due to voter discontent, is being filled by regional nationalist parties.

5) The Basque Country case demonstrates that the ability of nationalist forces to offer the electorate not one, but several political and ideological options of regional nationalism, primarily moderate centrist and radical left, is the key to their electoral success. In those regions where the nationalists represent only one political and ideological flank (mainly the left, for example, in Galicia), they inevitably lose.

6) The recent political history of the Basque Country, Catalonia, as well as Navarre, shows examples of the successful political tactics of the nationalists. Nationalist parties and coalitions receive support not only from those voters who are close to the ideas of the independence of the region, the creation of a special ethnic community, the strengthening of the regional language, but also voters who are either dissatisfied with the policy of the center (primarily the redistribution of funds from wealthy regions in favor of less wealthy ones) or sympathize with the measures taken by local nationalists who came to power. Groups of voters who do not share nationalist or separatist sentiments are gradually and not always consciously included in the orbit of nationalist parties’ influence. For example, the BNP abandoned radical demands for independence in the short- and medium-term period and switched to a more pragmatic way of promoting the region’s interests, which is expressed in pressure on the central government through the negotiation process. On the one hand, the inability of national political forces to present themselves as defenders of the region’s interests. On the other hand, the successful electoral tactics of nationalists and the political diversity of their electoral message are important factors in strengthening centrifugal tendencies.

7) This paradox exists in Spain – voters who are not supporters of the independence of their region begin to vote for those parties that call for this, and gradually come to the conclusion that the idea of independence can be quite acceptable and promising if it is offers "their" party. This paradox is demonstrated, first of all, by the example of the BNP, whose position in the Basque Country has remained unshakable for more than 40 years. This is also true of the Catalan separatists, who have been in power for 10 years despite the political failure of their pro-independence plans.

8) Comparison of centrifugal tendencies in Catalonia and the Basque Country reveals two different options for the development of regional nationalism in Spain at the present stage. In the case of Catalonia, the nationalist movement after 2010 radicalized and took on a separatist

position. In the Basque Country, the nationalist movement has retained its moderate character and is still focused on promoting an autonomist political agenda. On the one hand, this is due to the different tactics and strategies of the Basque and Catalan parties in their relations with the central authorities. On the other hand, this is explained by the sharp increase in separatist sentiment in Catalonia after the financial crisis of 2008–2009 and after the conflict with the center over a new version of the Statute of Autonomy, which led to a fundamental programmatic reorientation and restructuring of the regional nationalist camp.

9) Centrifugal tendencies in Galicia are weaker than in the Basque Country and Catalonia. The main problem of Galician nationalism is that it is dominated by the left wing, and therefore it cannot attract a more moderate voter. Therefore, the central government manages to slow down the rise in popularity of separatist sentiments and limit socio-political discussions to the topic of achieving greater autonomy.

10) The centrifugal tendencies in Valencia are different from the centrifugal tendencies in Galicia in general, but are close to those in the Basque Country and Catalonia. The main feature of Valencian political nationalism lies in the skillful tactics of Valencian nationalists and their growing ability to win over voters outside their traditional electorate in an environment where issues of the territorial and political status of the region remain not the highest priority on the agenda of regional political debates.

11) There are four variants of nationalism in Spain: strong separatist nationalism (Catalonia example), strong irredentist nationalism (Basque Country), limited separatist nationalism (Galicia), limited irredentist nationalism (Valencia). These options for political centrifugation and the different speed of its intensification, on the one hand, allows the center to concentrate its efforts on some of the most problematic region. On the other hand, creates the risk of unexpected “holes” in various parts of the Spanish territorial-political system. .

12) Nowadays the most important factors determining the centrifugal tendencies in Spain are the inconsistency of the territorial-political model laid down by the 1978 Constitution and the Statutes of Autonomy. It is also a socio-economic factor that contributes to the consolidation of the leading position of some regions in comparison with others and stimulates regional disproportions, and the aspirations of some regions to consolidate their leading position, and others to improve their position within the “State of Autonomies”.

List of publications relevant to the thesis

1. Belous Y. Looking for an explanation of centrifugal tendencies in modern Spain (cases of Catalonia, Basque Country, Galicia) // *Latin America*. 2020. № 12. P. 51-61.
2. Belous J., Tarasov A. Factors of centrifugal political tendencies in Spain: a Qualitative comparative analysis // *Bulletin of Perm University. Political Science*. 2021. №15(1). P. 45–56.
3. Belous Y., Zub A. Humanitarian Aspect of Spanish Foreign Policy in Latin America: Lessons for Russia // *The Journal of Education and Science “ISTORIYA” (“History”)*. 2022. Vol. 13. No.10 (120).
4. Belous Y. EU regional policy as a factor for decentralization in Spain. Basque Country case // *Latin America*. 2021. № 8. P. 38-51.
5. Belous Y. Factor of EU Regional Policy in Spain // *Social Sciences and Contemporary World*. 2022. № 3. P. 128-136.
6. Belous Y. Spanish public image of the EU regional policy // *Latin America*. 2022. № 3. C. 46-58.
7. Belous Y., Tarasov A. Coalition or Opposition? The Behaviour of Regionalist Parties in Multi-level Competition: The Cases of the Basque Country and Scotland // *RUDN Journal of Political Science*. 2022. Vol. 24. No. 2. P. 317-330.
8. Belous Y. Spanish public image of Party Podemos // *Latin America*. 2022. № 3. P. 46-58.

Work approbation

The main provisions and conclusions of the study were tested during the preparation of materials and the teaching courses to undergraduate of the National Research University Higher School of Economics: “Introduction to Regional Studies”, “Theory of International Relations”, “Introduction to International Relations”.

The main provisions and conclusions of the research were reflected during:

IV International Forum "Russia and Ibero-America in a Globalizing World: History and Modernity". Report: "The EU Regional policy in the development of modern Spain" (St. Petersburg, St. Petersburg State University, October 1-3, 2019);

II International Congress "Russia and Spain: Politics, Economics, Culture". Report "The Role of the EU Regional Policy in the Political Development of Spain" (Moscow, NRU HSE, 26 -27 November 2020);

European Consortium of Political Research (ECPR) General Conference. Report: "The Impact of the EU Regional Policy on Political Development of Spain" (UK, online, 24 – 28 August 2020);

XXII April International Academic Conference on Economic and Social Development. Report "The influence of the regional policy of the European Union on centrifugal tendencies in the EU Member States (Spanish case)" (Moscow, HSE, April 13-30, 2021);

"Lomonosov 2021" conference, Section "Regional problems of international relations: the West". Report: "Regional policy of the European Union as a factor of centrifugal tendencies in Spain" (Moscow, Moscow State University, April 12-23, 2021);

ECPR General Conference. Report "Factors of centrifugal political tendencies in Spain: a Qualitative Comparative Analysis" (UK, online, 30 August - 3 September 2021);

XXIII Yasin (April) International Academic Conference on Economic and Social Development. Report "Factors of centrifugal tendencies in the EU Member States (Spanish case)" (Moscow, NRU HSE April 4-8, 2022);

University of Salamanca, presentation as part of a research seminar with a report on the topic: "Factors of centrifugal tendencies in the EU Member States (Spanish case)" (Spain, Avila, October 28, 2021).

The research project of the thesis was included in the list of winners of the Russian Foundation for Basic Research competition for the best projects of fundamental research carried out by young scientists ("Postgraduate students") in 2020.

The results of the work were tested as part of a research internship at the Autonomous University of Madrid at the Faculty of Philosophy and Liberal Arts (Madrid, Spain) from September to December 2021.