Newspapers, Local News and Electoral Politics

Francesco Drago  
*University of Napoli, Parthenope; CSEF & IZA*

Tommaso Nannicini  
*Bocconi University, IGIER & IZA*

Francesco Sobbrio  
*IMT Lucca*

9th Workshop in Media Economics  
October 29, 2011
Motivations: news media and politics

An active and politically independent news media industry is, usually, considered a vital element for the health of democracies (Thomas Jefferson, 1787; Alexis de Toqueville, 1983; Bagdikian, 2000; Starr, 2009).

News media are supposed/expected to:

1. Inform or remind people that an election is taking place.
2. Provide information about the issues at stake, the candidates’ characteristics and political platforms.

What is the actual role played by news media on electoral outcomes, selection of politicians and government’s performance?
Motivations: news media and politics

- An active and politically independent news media industry is, usually, considered a vital element for the health of democracies (Thomas Jefferson, 1787; Alexis de Toqueville, 19831; Bagdikian, 2000; Starr, 2009).

- News media are supposed/expected to:

  I Inform or remind people that an election is taking place.
  I Provide information about the issues at stake, the candidates' characteristics and political platforms.
  I Keep politicians accountable.

What is the actual role played by news media on electoral outcomes, selection of politicians and government's performance?
Motivations: news media and politics

- An active and politically independent news media industry is, usually, considered a vital element for the health of democracies (Thomas Jefferson, 1787; Alexis de Toqueville, 1983; Bagdikian, 2000; Starr, 2009).

- News media are supposed/expected to:
  - Inform or remind people that an election is taking place.
Motivations: news media and politics

- An active and politically independent news media industry is, usually, considered a vital element for the health of democracies (Thomas Jefferson, 1787; Alexis de Toqueville, 1983; Bagdikian, 2000; Starr, 2009).

- News media are supposed/expected to:
  - Inform or remind people that an election is taking place.
  - Provide information about the issues at stake, the candidates’ characteristics and political platforms.
Motivations: news media and politics

- An active and politically independent news media industry is, usually, considered a vital element for the health of democracies (Thomas Jefferson, 1787; Alexis de Tocqueville, 1983; Bagdikian, 2000; Starr, 2009).

- News media are supposed/expected to:
  - Inform or remind people that an election is taking place.
  - Provide information about the issues at stake, the candidates’ characteristics and political platforms.
  - Keep politicians accountable.
Motivations: news media and politics

An active and politically independent news media industry is, usually, considered a vital element for the health of democracies (Thomas Jefferson, 1787; Alexis de Toqueville, 1983; Bagdikian, 2000; Starr, 2009).

News media are supposed/expected to:

▶ Inform or remind people that an election is taking place.
▶ Provide information about the issues at stake, the candidates’ characteristics and political platforms.
▶ Keep politicians accountable.

What is the actual role played by news media on electoral outcomes, selection of politicians and government’s performance?
This paper: newspapers and political outcomes

New dataset covering the presence of local news provided by different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) for all Italian municipalities with more than 15,000 inhabitants in the period 1993-2009.
This paper: newspapers and political outcomes

1. New dataset covering the presence of local news provided by different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) for all Italian municipalities with more than 15,000 inhabitants in the period 1993-2009.

2. Assess the impact of entry and exit of provincial newspapers or local editions of multi-regional/national newspapers on municipal politics:
- Electoral outcomes: turnout and incumbent mayor’s reelection.
- Selection of politicians: characteristics of elected mayors (i.e., gender and education).
- Local governments’ performance: taxes, revenues, transfers, efficiency measures (not yet).

3. Do different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) have different effects on voters’ and politicians’ characteristics and behavior?
This paper: newspapers and political outcomes

1. New dataset covering the presence of local news provided by different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) for all Italian municipalities with more than 15,000 inhabitants in the period 1993-2009.

2. Assess the impact of entry and exit of provincial newspapers or local editions of multi-regional/national newspapers on municipal politics:
   - **Electoral outcomes**: turnout and incumbent mayor’s reelection.
   - **Selection of politicians**: characteristics of elected mayors (i.e., gender and education).
   - **Local governments’ performance**: taxes, revenues, transfers, efficiency (not yet).

Drago, Nannicini, Sobbrio (October, 29, 2011)
This paper: newspapers and political outcomes

1. New dataset covering the presence of local news provided by different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) for all Italian municipalities with more than 15,000 inhabitants in the period 1993-2009.

2. Assess the impact of entry and exit of provincial newspapers or local editions of multi-regional/national newspapers on municipal politics:
   - **Electoral outcomes:** turnout and incumbent mayor’s reelection.
   - **Selection of politicians:** characteristics of elected mayors (i.e., gender and education).
This paper: newspapers and political outcomes

1. New dataset covering the presence of local news provided by different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) for all Italian municipalities with more than 15,000 inhabitants in the period 1993-2009.

2. Assess the impact of entry and exit of provincial newspapers or local editions of multi-regional/national newspapers on municipal politics:
   - **Electoral outcomes**: turnout and incumbent mayor’s reelection.
   - **Selection of politicians**: characteristics of elected mayors (i.e., gender and education).
   - **Local governments’ performance**: taxes, revenues, transfers, efficiency measures (not yet).
This paper: newspapers and political outcomes

1. New dataset covering the presence of local news provided by different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) for all Italian municipalities with more than 15,000 inhabitants in the period 1993-2009.

2. Assess the impact of entry and exit of provincial newspapers or local editions of multi-regional/national newspapers on municipal politics:
   - **Electoral outcomes**: turnout and incumbent mayor’s reelection.
   - **Selection of politicians**: characteristics of elected mayors (i.e., gender and education).
   - **Local governments’ performance**: taxes, revenues, transfers, efficiency measures (*not yet*).

3. Do different types of newspapers (provincial, multi-regional, national) have different effects on voters’ and politicians’ characteristics and behavior?
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.

- An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%.
- An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%.
- The presence of a local edition of a national newspapers does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out).

2. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.

3. Conditional on (2), newspapers have a significant effect on the selection of politicians. Specifically, an additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
   - Increases the probability of a "freshman" mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect).
   - Increases the probability of a "freshman" mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect).

Related literature

Drago, Nannicini, Sobbrio (October, 29, 2011) Local News and Electoral Politics
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%
   - The presence of a local edition of a national newspaper does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out)

2. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.

3. Conditional on (2), newspapers have a significant effect on the selection of politicians. Specifically, an additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
   - Increases the probability of a "freshman" mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect)
   - Increases the probability of a "freshman" mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect)

Related literature:
Drago, Nannicini, Sobbrio (October, 29, 2011) - Local News and Electoral Politics
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%.
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%.

2. The presence of a local edition of a national newspaper does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out).

3. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.

4. Conditional on (2), newspapers have a significant effect on the selection of politicians. Specifically, an additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect).
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect).

Related literature

Drago, Nannicini, Sobbrio (October, 29, 2011) Local News and Electoral Politics
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%
   - The presence of a local edition of a national newspaper does not have any significant effect (partial *crowding-out*)
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%
   - The presence of a local edition of a national newspapers does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out)

2. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%.
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%.
   - The presence of a local edition of a national newspapers does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out).

2. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.

3. Conditional on (2), newspapers have a significant effect on the selection of politicians. Specifically, an additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect).
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect).
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%
   - The presence of a local edition of a national newspapers does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out)

2. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.

3. Conditional on (2), newspapers have a significant effect on the selection of politicians. Specifically, an additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect)
Overview of main results

1. Different types of newspapers have different effects on electoral participation.
   - An additional provincial newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 1%
   - An additional multi-regional newspaper increases turnout in municipal elections by 5.3%
   - The presence of a local edition of a national newspapers does not have any significant effect (partial crowding-out)

2. The entry and exit of newspapers do not affect the probability of incumbent mayor being reelected.

3. Conditional on (2), newspapers have a significant effect on the selection of politicians. Specifically, an additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect)
   - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect).
Background. The Italian Newspaper Industry.

Geographical segmentation of news media in Italy: 93% of the Italian television market dominated by national TV stations (AGCOM, 2009) → Newspapers still remain the main, if not unique, source of information at the local level (Sorrentino, 2004; Murialdi and Tranfaglia, 2008).
Background. The Italian Newspaper Industry.

1 Geographical segmentation of news media in Italy: 93% of the Italian television market dominated by national TV stations (AGCOM, 2009) → Newspapers still remain the main, if not unique, source of information at the local level (Sorrentino, 2004; Muraldi and Tranfaglia, 2008).

2 Technological innovations: from the mid-80s, newspapers abandoned the linotype and other “hot-metal” typesetting machines by adopting photosetting and, later on, computerized typesetting → Decrease in the cost and the length of the production process.
Background. Italian municipalities.

- Since March 1993, mayors are directly elected with plurality rule and are subject to a two-term limit.

- Italian municipalities are in charge of a wide range of services (e.g., water supply, waste management, municipal police, etc.).
For each year between 1993 and 2009 → We identify, for each municipality with more than 15,000 people, the number of provincial newspapers/local edition of multi-regional and national newspapers providing news on that municipality.
Data, market definition and sample selection

- For each year between 1993 and 2009 → We identify, for each municipality with more than 15,000 people, the number of provincial newspapers/local edition of multi-regional and national newspapers providing news on that municipality.

- Both our newspaper data and electoral data are at the city-level → we define the **news market to be a city** → perfect overlap between the news market and the outcomes of interest.
Data, market definition and sample selection

- For each year between 1993 and 2009 → We identify, for each municipality with more than 15,000 people, the number of provincial newspapers/local edition of multi-regional and national newspapers providing news on that municipality.

- Both our newspaper data and electoral data are at the city-level → we define the news market to be a city → perfect overlap between the news market and the outcomes of interest.

- Electoral/Newspapers data on 758 Italian cities between 1993 and 2009.
Data, market definition and sample selection

- For each year between 1993 and 2009 → We identify, for each municipality with more than 15,000 people, the number of provincial newspapers/local edition of multi-regional and national newspapers providing news on that municipality. ▶ Data Newspaper Panel

- Both our newspaper data and electoral data are at the city-level → we define the **news market to be a city** → perfect overlap between the news market and the outcomes of interest.

- **Electoral/Newspapers data on 758 Italian cities between 1993 and 2009.**

- 542 city-years with net newspapers entry and 137 city-years with net newspapers exit.
Empirical framework

We estimate the effect of newspapers on political outcomes by using following regression model:

\[ y_{it} = \theta_{ht} + \gamma_i + \beta \cdot n_{it} + \tilde{\alpha} \cdot \tilde{x}_{it} + \lambda \cdot z_{it} + \varepsilon_{it}, \]  

(1)

- \( i \) denotes the city, \( h \) the macro-region and \( t \) the election year.
- Fixed effects: \( \theta_{ht} \) macro-region-by-year fixed effects, \( \gamma_i \) city-fixed effects.
- \( n_{it} \): number of newspapers providing local news on city \( i \) in year \( t \)
- \( \tilde{\alpha} \) is a vector of parameters and \( \tilde{x}_{it} \) is a vector of control variables at the city and/or province level changing over time (i.e., population, unemployment rate and difference between new and ceased firms in year \( t \)).
- \( z_{it} \): unobserved profitability of local news in city \( i \) in year \( t \) → \( \lambda \) is the degree of correlation between profitability and the electoral outcome once we control for \( \tilde{x}_{it}, n_{it} \) and the fixed effects \( \theta_{ht} \) and \( \gamma_i \).
- \( \varepsilon_{it} \): idiosyncratic unobserved error
Empirical Strategy.

- Investigate how a (discrete) increase or decrease in the supply of newspapers providing news on a given municipality affects political outcomes in that municipality, relative to other municipalities in the same macro-region and year that do not experience it.

Possible issues: the potential correlation between unobserved profitability and political outcomes may bias our results. The profitability of local news in city $i$ at time $t$, i.e., $z_{it}$, might be correlated to electoral outcomes (e.g., turnout) even after controlling for fixed effects and observable characteristics, i.e., $\lambda_i = 0$.
Empirical Strategy.

- Investigate how a (discrete) increase or decrease in the supply of newspapers providing news on a given municipality affects political outcomes in that municipality, relative to other municipalities in the same macro-region and year that do not experience it.

- Possible issues: the potential correlation between unobserved profitability $z_{it}$ and $y_{it}$ may bias our results.

$\rightarrow$ The profitability of local news in city $i$ at time $t$, i.e., $z_{it}$, maybe correlated to electoral outcomes (e.g., turnout) even after controlling for fixed effects and observable characteristics, i.e., $\lambda \neq 0 \rightarrow$ bias arising from correlation between $z_{it}$ and $n_{it}$.
Identification of causal effects. Discrete changes in the number of newspapers

- The identification exploits discrete changes in the number of newspapers in different election years.

- The entry of a newspaper arguably depends on a thresholds value $z^* \rightarrow$ whenever $z_{it} > z^*$, we should observe a newspaper entry.

- Discrete changes in the number of newspapers $\rightarrow$ entrance of a newspaper depends on whether $z_{it}$ is above this threshold $z^*$ rather than on the distance of $z_{it}$ from it.
Identification of causal effects. Discrete changes in the number of newspapers

- The identification exploits discrete changes in the number of newspapers in different election years.

- The entry of a newspaper arguably depends on a thresholds value \( z^* \) whenever \( z_{it} > z^* \), we should observe a newspaper entry.

- Discrete changes in the number of newspapers → entrance of a newspaper depends on whether \( z_{it} \) is above this threshold \( z^* \) rather than on the distance of \( z_{it} \) from it.

- Periods with large variations in \( z_{it} \) and no entry (i.e., \( z_{it} \) remains below \( z^* \)) and periods with small variations in \( z_{it} \) and entry (i.e., \( z_{it} \) goes above \( z^* \)). (Gentzkow et al. 2010).
Identification of causal effects. Discrete changes in the number of newspapers

- The identification exploits discrete changes in the number of newspapers in different election years.

- The entry of a newspaper arguably depends on a thresholds value $z^*$ → whenever $z_{it} > z^*$, we should observe a newspaper entry.

- Discrete changes in the number of newspapers → entrance of a newspaper depends on whether $z_{it}$ is above this threshold $z^*$ rather than on the distance of $z_{it}$ from it.

- Periods with large variations in $z_{it}$ and no entry (i.e., $z_{it}$ remains below $z^*$) and periods with small variations in $z_{it}$ and entry (i.e., $z_{it}$ goes above $z^*$). (Gentzkow et al. 2010).
  - Even if $\lambda \neq 0$, the variation in profitability between $t-1$ and $t$ explains a small part of the variation in $n_{it}$.
Identification of causal effects. No correlation with past changes in political outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Previous turnout rates and newspapers</th>
<th>Number of provincial newspapers</th>
<th>Number of multiregional newspapers</th>
<th>Number of national newspapers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Turnout (t-1)</td>
<td>.7483</td>
<td>-.1797</td>
<td>.7259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.489)</td>
<td>(.3435)</td>
<td>(.6773)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turnout (t-2)</td>
<td>2.387*</td>
<td>.2343</td>
<td>-.1102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.327)</td>
<td>(.3206)</td>
<td>(.3218)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-test, both coefficients=0</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City and provincial characteristics</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroregional-by-year fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R-squared</td>
<td>0.936</td>
<td>0.984</td>
<td>0.904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of cities</td>
<td>610</td>
<td>610</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>1038</td>
<td>1038</td>
<td>1038</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Standard errors in parentheses are clustered at the province level.
Identification of causal effects. Technological innovations.

Overall, the evolution of the Italian newspaper industry suggests that technological innovations have been, most likely, the key drivers of the observed expansion in the supply of local news.

Negative shocks in the newspapers’ cost function have decreased the gross revenues threshold above which newspapers find optimal to enter in a local market → indirectly induced the entry of additional newspapers in the local market for news.
Newspapers and turnout

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Turnout</th>
<th>Turnout</th>
<th>Turnout</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of provincial newspapers</td>
<td>.0083**</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0043)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of multi-regional newspapers</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.0431***</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(.0081)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of national newspapers</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-.0038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(.0056)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City and provincial characteristics</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macrolegisterial-by-year fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average dependent variable</td>
<td>0.792</td>
<td>0.792</td>
<td>0.792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R-squared</td>
<td>0.903</td>
<td>0.904</td>
<td>0.902</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of cities</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>2365</td>
<td>2365</td>
<td>2365</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Standard errors in parentheses are clustered at the province level.
Discussion and magnitudes

- An additional multi-regional (provincial) newspaper increases turnout 5.3% (1%)

- Partial crowding-out effect on local participation by former readers of the local incumbent newspaper, created by the entrance of a national newspaper in a local market for news (George and Waldfogel, 2003; 2008).

- Magnitudes of these effects in line with most of the literature (Strömberg, 2004; Gentzkow, 2006; Oberholzer-Gee and Waldfogel, 2010) but substantially larger than the one found by Gentzkow et al. (2010), i.e., 0.3 percentage points.
Discussion and magnitudes

- An additional multi-regional (provincial) newspaper increases turnout 5.3% (1%).

- Partial crowding-out effect on local participation by former readers of the local incumbent newspaper, created by the entrance of a national newspaper in a local market for news (George and Waldfogel, 2003; 2008).

- Magnitudes of these effects in line with most of the literature (Strömberg, 2004; Gentzkow, 2006; Oberholzer-Gee and Waldfogel, 2010) but substantially larger than the one found by Gentzkow et al. (2010), i.e., 0.3 percentage points.

- Similarly to Oberholzer-Gee and Waldfogel (2010) and unlike Gentzkow et al. (2010), we estimate the effect of local news on local elections → the informational content of local news provided by a newspaper in our sample is likely to be very salient.
## Newspapers and incumbent's reélection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Probability of incumbent mayor relected</th>
<th>Probability of incumbent mayor relected</th>
<th>Probability of incumbent mayor relected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of provincial newspapers</td>
<td>-.0272</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0477)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of multi-regional newspapers</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.0153</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(.1894)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of national newspapers</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-.0386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(.0668)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City and provincial characteristics</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroregional-by-year fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average dependent variable</td>
<td>0.258</td>
<td>0.258</td>
<td>0.258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R-squared</td>
<td>0.362</td>
<td>0.361</td>
<td>0.366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of cities</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>2261</td>
<td>2261</td>
<td>2261</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Standard errors in parentheses are clustered at the province level.

Theory and previous evidence
## Newspapers and selection of mayors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Years of Schooling</th>
<th>College</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of provincial newspapers</td>
<td>.0356</td>
<td>.1771</td>
<td>.0418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0234)</td>
<td>(.1970)</td>
<td>(.0397)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of multi-regional newspapers</td>
<td>.0459</td>
<td>1.021</td>
<td>.0473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0464)</td>
<td>(1.194)</td>
<td>(.1799)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of national newspapers</td>
<td>.0239</td>
<td>-.5077</td>
<td>-.0808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0651)</td>
<td>(.3662)</td>
<td>(.0778)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City and provincial characteristics</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroregional-by-year fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average dependent variable</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>0.646</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of cities</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>687</td>
<td>687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>2261</td>
<td>2223</td>
<td>2223</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Standard errors in parentheses are clustered at the province level.
Newspapers and selection of *freshmen* mayors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Gender - conditional on <em>freshman</em> mayor</th>
<th>Years of Schooling - conditional on <em>freshman</em> mayor</th>
<th>College - conditional on <em>freshman</em> mayor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of provincial newspapers</td>
<td>.0522</td>
<td>.1963</td>
<td>.0576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0345)</td>
<td>(.2438)</td>
<td>(.0519)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of multi-regional newspapers</td>
<td>.1466*</td>
<td>1.401*</td>
<td>.2762*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0741)</td>
<td>(.8222)</td>
<td>(.1637)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of national newspapers</td>
<td>.0252</td>
<td>-.6013</td>
<td>-.0980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(.0252)</td>
<td>(.4043)</td>
<td>(.0923)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City and provincial characteristics</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroregional-by-year fixed effects</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average dependent variable</td>
<td>0.073</td>
<td>15.45</td>
<td>0.661</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of cities</td>
<td>684</td>
<td>680</td>
<td>680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>1678</td>
<td>1645</td>
<td>1645</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Standard errors in parentheses are clustered at the province level.
Discussion: newspapers and selection of politicians

Two main effects of an increase in the supply of newspapers on the selection of politicians.

1. Sizeable positive effect of an increase in the supply of newspapers providing local news on the education of elected mayors (quality effect)
Discussion: newspapers and selection of politicians

Two main effects of an increase in the supply of newspapers on the selection of politicians.

1. Sizeable positive effect of an increase in the supply of newspapers providing local news on the education of elected mayors (*quality effect*)

2. Lowering barriers to entry into political representation for candidates that are ex-ante less favored (percentage of women political representation in Italy is extremely low) (*underdog effect*)
Conclusions

- Preliminary evidence seems to suggest that provincial and multi-regional newspapers have a significant effect on electoral participation (1% to 5.3%). No significant effect of national newspapers (partial crowding-out).

- Selection of “freshmen” mayors consistent with the patterns found on electoral participation. An additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect)
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect)
Conclusions

- Preliminary evidence seems to suggest that provincial and multi-regional newspapers have a significant effect on electoral participation (1% to 5.3%). No significant effect of national newspapers (partial crowding-out).

- No effect of newspapers on incumbents’ reelection probability.
Conclusions

- Preliminary evidence seems to suggest that provincial and multi-regional newspapers have a significant effect on electoral participation (1% to 5.3%). No significant effect of national newspapers (partial crowding-out).

- No effect of newspapers on incumbents’ reelection probability.

- Selection of “freshmen” mayors consistent with the patterns found on electoral participation. An additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (underdog effect)
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (quality effect)
Conclusions

- Preliminary evidence seems to suggest that provincial and multi-regional newspapers have a significant effect on electoral participation (1% to 5.3%). No significant effect of national newspapers (partial *crowding-out*).

- No effect of newspapers on incumbents’ reelection probability.

- Selection of “freshmen” mayors consistent with the patterns found on electoral participation. An additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (*underdog effect*)
Conclusions

- Preliminary evidence seems to suggest that provincial and multi-regional newspapers have a significant effect on electoral participation (1% to 5.3%). No significant effect of national newspapers (partial *crowding-out*).

- No effect of newspapers on incumbents’ reelection probability.

- Selection of “freshmen” mayors consistent with the patterns found on electoral participation. An additional multi-regional newspaper supplying local news:
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor being a woman by 14 percentage points (*underdog effect*)
  - Increases the probability of a “freshman” mayor having a college degree by 27 percentage points (*quality effect*)
Expand electoral and newspapers dataset (analyze also impact of newspapers on national elections).

Analyze incumbency advantage (rather than just prob. of reelection)

Data on local governments’ outcomes (revenues, taxes, deficit, transfers, efficiency measures) → Assess the effect of newspapers on politicians’ effort.
Related literature.

1. News media and electoral outcomes (turnout and incumbency advantage):

2. News media and selection of politicians: *Snyder-Strömberg, 2010, JPE.*
News media and turnout


2 Evidence:


News media and incumbent’s reelection

Snyder and Strömberg (2010, *JPE*) “It is not obvious that voters with more information will be more supportive of incumbents.”

1. Non univocal theoretical prediction:
   1. Besley and Prat (2006, *AER*): increase in the number of media outlets decreases the probability of media capture by the incumbent → decreases the incumbency advantage and increases the turnover of politicians.
   2. Prat and Strömberg (2011): increase in the amount of media coverage increases, on average, the incumbent’s vote share.

2. Mixed evidence:
   4. Gentzkow et al. (2010, *AER*) do not find any clear evidence of newspapers increasing or decreasing the incumbency advantage.
Technological innovations & expansion of local news

**Decrease in fixed cost of production.** Even small production facilities become profitable (Grandinetti, 2008; Isnenghi, 2008) → increase in the number of provincial newspapers.
Technological innovations & expansion of local news (2)

**Increase in Synergies.** Sharp decrease in the cost of exchanging news agency releases, ads, materials among connected newspapers → expansion in the supply of local news provided by national and multi-regional newspapers.
Expansion of local news

Number of newspapers 1985

Changes in number of newspapers 1985-2009
Expansion of local news

Newspapers per 10,000 people, 1985

Changes in number of newspapers per 10,000 people, 1985-2009
The Italian Newspaper Industry. Circulation.

The pattern of circulation over time does not seem to suggest any positive trend in readership levels (i.e., no endogenous increase in the willingness to become informed about political news by Italian citizens).
More than 80% of net entries of newspapers occurs in years with no municipal elections.

Since elections take place every 4/5 years this is the fraction one would expect if entries and exits were as good as random (with respect to the timing of elections).
Identification issues (2): media capture

- Incumbent politicians may manipulate the supply of newspapers providing local news in order to influence their reelection probability.

- Politicians control over media is a serious concern at the national level in Italy. However, this does not seem to be the case at local level:
  1. A large fraction of newspapers in our sample provide local news (also) on cities different from the one where they are headquartered.
  2. Number of newspapers providing local news is not significatively correlated with incumbent’s reelection probability.
## Newspapers competition and turnout

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Turnout</th>
<th>Turnout</th>
<th>Turnout</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City has 0 provincial newspaper at t-1</td>
<td>0.0087**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0046)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City has 1 or more provincial newspaper at t-1</td>
<td>0.0086</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.005)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City has 0 multi-regional newspaper at t-1</td>
<td>0.0386***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0077)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City has 1 or more multi-regional newspaper at t-1</td>
<td>0.0170</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0116)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City has 0 national newspaper at t-1</td>
<td>-0.0045</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0076)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City has 1 or more national newspaper at t-1</td>
<td>-0.0082</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0067)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

City and provincial characteristics       YES        YES        YES

City fixed effects                       YES        YES        YES

Macroregional-by-year fixed effects      YES        YES        YES

R-squared                              0.901      0.901      0.899

Number of cities                        655        655        655

Observations                           1693       1693       1693

Note: Standard errors in parentheses are clustered at the province level.
Data. Newspapers panel

- Directory of newspapers from annual report of the Italian Authority for Communication (AGCOM) 1985-2009 (name, location, owners, etc.).

- Multi-regional and national newspapers: info on the presence of local editions by cross-checking a variety of sources (i.e., directly contacting the newspapers; Iannace, 1989; Lenzi, 2001; Grandinetti, 2008; “Il Grande Libro della Stampa Italiana”, 1993-2010).

- For each year → identify whether a provincial newspaper/local edition of a multi-regional or national newspaper, provided only news on the capital of the province (capoluogo di provincia) or it also provided news on the cities of that province.

- Impute the presence of local news provided by newspaper $k$ for any city $i$ with more than 15,000 people belonging to province $j$ whenever newspaper $k$ was providing local news on province $j$. 
Data. Electoral outcomes and politicians’ characteristics

- Electoral Data from the Italian Minister for internal affairs.

- Data on the individual characteristics of elected politicians from the “Public Administrator Registry” (Anagrafe degli Amministratori) by the Minister for Internal Affairs. (first and last name of each elected politician, level of education, profession, date of birth, gender, political affiliation, date of appointment).
Motivations: struggling newspaper industry

Change in per cent in titles versus per cent change in paid circulation, OECD, 2000-2008
Public subsidies to the press

Direct subsidies in OECD countries in 2008:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Subsidies (in billions of euros)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>51.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>29.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>0.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Italy: every year, around 500 million euros are spent in public subsidies (direct and indirect) to the newspaper industry → not assigned according to criteria based on pluralism or efficiency but exogenously targeted to specific newspapers’ categories (e.g., newspapers owned by political parties or by religious organizations).
## Market structure transition matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 Newspapers</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Newspaper</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Newspapers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Newspapers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Newspapers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5+ Newspapers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Table shows number of city-years in sample experiencing a given transition