Svetlana A. Yatsyk

FEUDAL FORMULAS IN LOVE
LYRICS OF WILLIAM IX OF AQUITAINE

BASIC RESEARCH PROGRAM

WORKING PAPERS

SERIES: HUMANITIES
WP BRP 74/HUM/2014

This Working Paper is an output of a research project presented at a workshop or conference at the National Research University Higher School of Economics (HSE). Any opinions or claims contained in this Working Paper do not necessarily reflect the views of HSE.
Svetlana A. Yatsyk

FEUDAL FORMULAS IN LOVE LYRICS OF WILLIAM IX OF AQUITAINE

William, Ninth Duke of Aquitaine (1071-1127) was one of the most powerful feudal lords of his day. Probably inspired by the intricate verse forms he discovered in Arabic Spain and Syria, he seems to have created the first troubadour lyrics (in his own words, “a chansoneta nueva” (new song), “un vers ... totz mesclatz d'amor e de joy e de joven” (a verse ... all mixed with love and joy and youth)).

The fact that he shared courtly values and behaved himself has never been called in question in historiography. The cornerstone problem of this research is as follows: how and for what reason did William apply the specific feudal formulas in his poetry. In his canzones one can face a number of turns which were then recorded by later troubadours and became a kind of clichés displaying the ceremonies practiced in the South French society and connected to the formation of feudal system, especially to relations between vassal and his lord.

Keywords: William IX of Aquitaine, troubadour, feudalism, canzone, Old Provencal, versification

JEL Classification: Z.

---

1 National Research University Higher School of Economics. Faculty of History. Centre for medieval studies. E-mail: syatsyk@hse.ru
Troubadours, medieval lyric poets, who wrote in late XI - XIII centuries in folk languages\(^2\), gave a powerful incentive to the beginning and development of the very first literary language in Europe. This language was rooted in the folk parlance (namely in the Limousine dialect) and constituted a functional equivalent of the Latin. The language of troubadours was applied in all types of cultural registers and genres: in prosaic “Vidas of the Troubadours”\(^3\) as well as in administrative acts; in translations of scientific and philosophical texts from Latin and Arabic languages as well as in sermons and theological disputations. It was the first unified roman language; in (and about) this particular language were written the pioneering grammatical treatises. Moreover, they created the first poetic tradition in a modern language that influenced the formation of Italian poetic school at the beginning of XIII century and served as a model to Spanish, French and German national schools\(^4\). Finally, the troubadours not only created the literary language but also stood at the beginning of high life and specific courteous culture reflected in their poetry, which has rethought the key notions of feudal and clerical codes. Above-mentioned specific application of “feudal” terms in the lyrics of troubadours is in the scope of present research.

Historians and philologists often face the problem of the origins of troubadours’ poetry; the courteous doctrine as well as the poetical canzone-writing technique can be found in the works of the first troubadour, William IX of Aquitaine\(^5\), i.e. one cannot trace the formation of troubadours’ poetry, for there are no intermediary stages between it and the preceding works. There are no intermediate forms between this poetry and the texts that have influenced its formation. This is the subject of much debate, what exactly made an impact on the formation of the language and troubadours’ versification techniques. The majority of researchers admit the influence of the following factors: folklore\(^6\), ancient literature, liturgical motets\(^7\), Arabic poetry\(^8\) that was advanced in neighboring Spain and Sufic conception of sublime love, but they have not yet come to agreement concerning the correlation of these factors.

\(^3\) Egan, M (ed.) 1984 Vidas of the Troubadours, Garland, New York.
\(^6\) For example, in the texts as well as in the melody of the ballad (prov. balata — “dance tune”) one can easily trace several traits of folk round dances.
\(^7\) Six-line stanza with a strict two-rhyme scheme (8a 8a 8b 8b 4a 4b) applied by William in four of his canzones is directly adopted from the latin trope (verse introduced as embellishment into the Mass) that has a similar melodic pattern.
\(^8\) So-called “Arabian hypothesis” is really widely spread; it is based on constatation of close economical, dynastic and cultural connections between Occitany and Spain. Zajal” (arab. زجال “song”), a traditional form of oral strophic poetry, presented, for example, by works of Abu Bakr Abd al-Malik ibn Quzman, was known long before the formation of troubadours’ lyrics. In most cases the stanzaic prosody of William’s canzones matches with that of ibn Quzman – See Zhirmunskiy, V 1971 “Srednevekovyiie literaturyi kak predmet sravnitelnogo literaturovedeniya”, Izvestiya AN SSSR. Otdelenie literaturyi i yazyika, Vol. 30, №3, Moscow, p. 194, Staf, I 2007 Op. cit, p. 521.
William IX of Aquitaine is of interest as an initiator of emergence of the new language and as a founder of a new literary tradition. He gave impetus to the creation of the courtly knight's code, a behavior pattern that spread in Europe in XII-XIII centuries. The fact that William IX shared courtly values and behaved himself has never been called in question in historiography; therefore, I am not going to focus on these subjects in his lyrics. The cornerstone problem of present research is as follows: how and for what reason did William apply the specific feudal formulas in his poetry. In his canzones one can face a number of turns which were then recorded by later troubadours and became a kind of clichés displaying the ceremonies practiced in the South French society and connected to the formation of feudal system, especially to relations between vassal and his lord.

For better understanding of William’s motivations it is rather useful to undertake an excursus in his biography. William was a son of William VIII of Aquitaine by his third wife, Hildegarde of Burgundy. In 1086 at the age of Fifteen, William inherited the duchy and the county upon the death of his father. At age sixteen, he has probably married Ermengarde, Fulk VI of Anjou’s daughter, and spent with her 3 years from 1088 to 1091. Then, when Ermengarde entered the monastery of Fontevrault, William married Philippa, the daughter and inheritress of William IV of Toulouse (she was his only surviving child and possessed undoubted rights of inheritance to the Toulousain). By Philippa, William had two sons and five daughters, including his eventual successor, William X. His second son, Raymond, eventually became the Prince of Antioch in the Holy Land, and his daughter Agnes married firstly Aimery V of Thouars and then Ramiro II of Aragon, reestablishing dynastic ties with that ruling house.

9 The notion of “cortezia” (courtesy) originates in French term “court” and thus the courtly behavior is a conduct that was appropriate at court. The notion of courtesy is not limited to the courtly etiquette; rather it incarnates the idea of service itself, and not the submission to a concrete person but the service to the ideals of corresponding society. The courtesy involves following qualities: mesura (measure), jovens (youth), valors (a courtly virtue that can be compared (and opposed) to the virtue of Christian and military valour), gentileza (acquaintance with the principles of courtly behavior), largueza (generosity), fizeltat (devotion), humilta (modesty and leniency), parage (balance of spiritual and moral requirements and physical, corporal acts), sen (counterbalancing reason) and an ability to feel joi. It is noteworthy that among appreciated and commanding respect qualities one can find some characteristic contradicting the Christian value system (such as, for example, orgueil (pride, arrogance) (see canzone XI)).
10 Troubadours’ lyrics could influence the formation of courtly worldview only at the beginning of its formation, id est in late XI – early XII century. And at that particular period the majority of troubadours was descended from the highest stratum of the nobility: among troubadours there were at least five kings (for example, Alfonso II and Richard the Lion Heart, ten counts (William IX of Aquitaine, Dalfi d’Alvernha, count de Rodes) and a great number of viscounts (Raymond Jourdan, Bertran de Born); honourary canonics could also be find among the troubadours (such as Folquet de Marselha, Aimeric de Beleno, Gui d’Ussel, Guillem Ramon de Gironella or Jofre de Foixà).
12 See canzone X, lines 21-22: “in donet ... son anel” (she gave me her ring); line 31: “Nos n’avem la pess’e-l coutel” (we have both knife and slice); canzone XI, lines 41-42 “Aissi guerpise ... vair e gris e sembe li” (so I leave …vair and grey squirrel and sable furs).
13 Weir, A 2000 Eleanor of Aquitaine, Pimlico, Random House, p. 10. But it is highly likely that Philippa of Toulouse was William’s only wife.
In 1095, Urban II invited him to take part in the First Crusade, but William was more interested in exploiting the absence on Crusade of Raymond IV of Toulouse, his wife's uncle to press her claim to Toulouse. Therefore, he broke a sacred pledge to protect the lands of his neighbors who went on the First Crusade, an act for which he was threatened with excommunication. Yet he became jealous of their early conquests in the Holy Land and led the disastrous Crusade of the Faint-Hearted in 1101.

He spent 18 months in Holy Land where he took part in battles at Anatoly, quite often suffering a defeat. Having barely survived that escapade, he later met greater success in several campaigns against the Moors. In 1102, he came back to Aquitaine, but the peaceful life of the senior did not satisfy him, “valorous knight” and “great deceiver of women”\textsuperscript{15}\textsuperscript{16}. Shortly after his return from the Holy Land he started to learn Latin and took up the brush, beginning to compose rhythmic verses imitating Latin poets\textsuperscript{17}. Then he switched to versification in his mother language.

William repeatedly defied the Church, his first excommunication was followed by another one, this time the reason was his extramarital affair with Viscountess Dangerose (Dangerosa), the wife of his vassal Aimery I de Rochefoucauld, Viscount of Châtellerault. William installed her in the Maubergeonne tower of his castle in Poitiers and painted a picture of her on his shield\textsuperscript{18}. His wife, Philippa, chose in 1116 to retire to the Abbey of Fontevrault.

In the evening of his life William entered into alliance with the king of Castile and Leon Alfonso I of Aragon. His troops fought side by side with Castilians in an effort to take Cordoba between 1120 and 1123. William IX died on 10 February 1126, aged 55, after suffering a short illness, having left his possession to his son William X.

He was violent, passionate and impulsive, and at the same time detached, ironical and educated, keenly aware of his own interests; a man, as he said, who desired what he could not have and never enjoyed what he loved (c'anc d'aquo c'amiei no m jauzi ... quaer vueill so que non pues aver (canzone VII, lines 14, 20)).

This portrait mismatches an image of courtly lover who admires the Lady and dedicates himself to her service that appears in the lyrics of later troubadours. So, what did William’s ego-character look like? Should we interpret the “feudal” metaphors describing his relations with the Lady ad litteram? Do his poems offer any metaphoric link between the apparent contradictions of dominating and submissive male?

\textsuperscript{15} These qualities are imputed to William by his \textit{Vida}. See: 1993 Zhizneopisaniya trubadurov, Nauka, Moscow, p. 8.

\textsuperscript{16} William’s contempt for women shouldn’t be overestimated. Of course, sometimes his discourse was very misogynistic, but apart from his chauvinism there is another explanation for this phenomenon. Language is a vehicle of power. William communicated about the desired women to the men at the court, he needed to be understood and et the same time respected. So, the men were included while the women were incorporated by excluded of his lyrics.


\textsuperscript{18} Ibid., p. 96.
I am going to answer this question by means of textual analysis of II, V, VII, IX, X and XI canzones of William IX of Aquitaine\textsuperscript{19}. These pieces are united by the author’s narrative style, common form (canzone), ‘active’ vocabulary of the poet. This very fact that we study not a solid work, but a bunch of them created in different time, helps us draw conclusions about distinctive marks of William’s parlance, which – constantly changing depending on canzones subject – preserved a set of fundamental attributes.

Canzone – the basic lyric genre of the troubadours; it’s a poetical composition made of several stanzas, often with a tornado instead of chorus. The stanzas could vary in terms of length but octosyllabics and decasyllabics of choreic origin were the most common; however by the late XII century the length of a stanza as well as alteration of rhymes had hit an extreme diversity. Canzone is the most diversified genre of all represented in troubadours, in some classifications, it comprised tenso, pastorela, alba, sirventes and several other kinds of songs.

All the canzones we work with were written by William after his return from the Holy Land, i.e. after 1102. Hence, all these works are dated from the first quarter of the XII century, and the “farewell song” – from the year 1110, when William was wounded in the leg in Taillebourg and was preparing to die. They were all written in Old Provencal. However there were no Provencal grammar in William’s lifetime\textsuperscript{20} therefore his speech is probably more characteristic of himself, rather than of his linguistic environment.


Intellectuals of early modern times were inclined to praise poetic talent of William\textsuperscript{21}, even though not all of them were familiar with his works (the case of Jean Besly\textsuperscript{22} or Pierre de Caseneuve\textsuperscript{23}).

\textsuperscript{19} So long as my research is based on the publication made by Jeanroy (Jeanroy, A (ed.) 1964, Les chansons de Guillaume IX duc d’Aquitaine (1071-1127), 2nd ed., Librairie Honoré Champion, Paris), I adopted his numeration of canzones.

\textsuperscript{20} A pioneer of describing the peculiarities of classical Occitan was a Catalan troubadour Raimon Vidal de Bezaudu who addressed his work “Las razos de trobar” first and foremost to his compatriots who did not know any other language for poetry up to the XV century.

\textsuperscript{21} Jeanroy, A 1964 Op. cit, p. V.

\textsuperscript{22} Besly, J 1647, Histoire des comtes de Poitou et ducs de Guyenne, Bertault, Paris, p. 121.

\textsuperscript{23} de Caseneuve, P 1659, L’origine des Jeux Fleureaux de Toulouse, R. Bosc, Toulouse, p. 39.
Dadin de Hauteserre, a legal adviser from Toulouse, was the first one to look through the manuscripts of William’s canzones and to publish it. He included in the book “History of Aquitaine” (*Rerum aquitanicarum libri quinque*) two canzones of William the Vth and the XIth (see p. 499 and 501 respectively). This edition reproduces precisely, up to the spelling errors of the copyist, the manuscript C from Toulouse.

The first complete edition of William's literary heritage was made by Raynouard (1761-1836), who afterwards published a Provencal-French dictionary which I found useful. While working with medieval manuscripts, Raynouard discovered that along with the Old French language in the territory of nowadays France there was another one, more ancient roman language. Impressed by its homogeneity and artistic qualities, Raynouard wrote and published a grammar of this language, furnished with numerous extracts of Occitan literature including William IX of Aquitaine’s lyrics. In the introduction Raynouard supposed that the language he discovered was the only direct extension of the *lingua romana rustica*, the vernacular language that the clergy was directed to use in sermons after the Council of Tours in 813. He believed that initially it was a common folk roman language, widespread in all southern parts of the Empire of Charlemagne (i.e. in Provence, Eastern Spain, a part of Portugal and Italy). This theory was based on the term *romanz*, an autochthonous word used by Provençal to describe their language as opposed to the Latin.

Adalbert von Keller claimed that his collections were exhaustive and contained the complete literary heritage of William, but these volumes lack the II and the X canzones as well as the first two stanzas of canzone V. This edition was based on the manuscript C and the manuscript F.

Some William's poems shocked the Victorian sensibilities of late XIX century Provencalists. In the German historiography of the early XX century was even inherent a tendency towards filtration of studied texts aiming at corroborating the idea that the love glorified by the troubadours was purely and solely platonic.

---

25 Friedman, R 1955, "Trubadury i ih istolkovateli (K voprosu ob idealisticheskoj interpretatsii staroprovansalskoj literatury)", in: Ryazanskiy gosudarstvennyiy pedagogicheskiy institut. Uchenyie zapiski, vol. 10 (Kafedra literaturyi; Kafedra russkogo yazyika), Ryazan, pp. 58.
27 This opposition “latī” vs “romanz” is present in the canzone X of William IX of Aquitaine: “et il prec en Jezu del tron en romans et en son latī” (and let him praise lord Jesus in his throne both in the common tongue and in his).
30 Soviet and Marxist historian R. Friedman explained that by the fact that modern Europeans believe that they are successors of medieval poets’ culture, that’s why they cannot submit the glorification of non-platonic love out of wedlock. See: Friedman, R 1965, “Lyubovnaya lirika trubadurov i ee istolkovanie”, Ryazanskiy pedagogicheskiy institut, Uchonyie zapiski, vol. 34, Moscow, p. 403.
A characteristic feature of the Soviet historiography, especially of R. Friedman’s works was the opposite. Friedman flatly opposed “the feudal theory” that derives images of Old Provencal literature to formulas of feudal law. All the classical courtly symbols of troubadours’ poems, such as, for example, William’s desire “to put his hands under the cape” of his Lady (canzone X, Qu’aia mas manz soz son mantel), she suggested to interpret as literally as possible. She considered “the code of love”, “feudal love”, “a cult of the Lady” to be the artificially created entities.

It’s hard to assess the authenticity of the sources we use, for these are belles-lettres and hence interacting with them one should stick to a private agreement which Coleridge called “the suspension of disbelief”. “The reader has to know that what is being narrated is an imaginary story, but he must not therefore believe that the writer is telling lies”. There are no songs tendentiously depicting historical events, no civil lyrics, no sirventes praising suzerain, no songs calling to arms like those of Bertran de Born; no plots that William would study religiously or - to the opposite - distort. Though he mentions his contemporaries (Fulk of Anjou, King Louis VI), tells which administrative entities existed in his country (he mentions Gascogne and Anjou as subjects if Province politics). Basing on his writings one can draw some preliminary conclusions on the flora and the fauna of contemporary Aquitaine, for William mentions plants (albespi), birds (li auzel), capons (capos), a horse (caval), a jade (palafrei), and a cat (chat).

The parlance of William IX of Aquitania is based on his native poitevin dialect, drawing towards the southern group of French dialects, but William consciously borrowed from the northern ones, aiming to force the expressiveness of his verses. He aimed at looking for an interesting rhyme, effort to avoid the homonyms and the polysemy and not to use the words that have a pejorative meaning in everyday language (but it should be noted that sometimes William did quite the contrary: he resorted to the folk or current terms in order to contrast described phenomena with the same but related to the courtly life; for this purpose in the canzone X he used the word “drudari” instead of “amor” to designate love).

As for particular distinctive features of his parlance, one may notice a transformation of closed Latin é into ei, whereas in “normal” aquitanian it didn’t change its form. Such phenomena are observed in no other South-French dialects, though it often happens in late

31 R. Friedman has devoted an article “Troubadours and their interprepreneurs” (“Trubadury i ih istolkovateli (K voprosu ob idealisticheskoy interpretatsii staroprovansalskoy literatury)”) to the dethronement of this theory that she considered to be “one of the most practical fictions, aiming at neglecting the passionate character and antiascetic orientation of old provencal poetry”.
32 Friedman, R 1965, “Trubadury i ih istolkovateli, p. 60.
34 Meylah, M 1975 Yazyik trubadurov, Nauka, Moscow, p. 20-21.
troubadours, no matter which country they belong to (for instance see Cercamon, Marcabru, Bernart de Ventadorn, Bertran de Born).

One more distinction is the vocalization of *l* and *ll* after and in the end of a word. This effect is peculiar to late troubadours and it was spread in the XIII century. The whole phenomena could be accounted for by Gascognian dialect’s influence, would it be found in the works of Gascognian troubadours. Though it’s not there, instead we see it in those troubadours who have nothing to do with Gascogne (in Bertran de Born, a baron from the Limousin; in Peire Vidal or Raimbaut of Orange)\(^{36}\).

Grounding on Williams lyrics one can study this man and his contemporaries. It's not easy to give a straight answer, what goals did he pursue creating his songs. Knowing his life, his love for freedom and his wit\(^{37}\), we find it possible to name among others one motivation still relevant for poets - a need for self-expression, “artistic itch” peculiar to gifted persons, inability not to write.

But this was not of course the sole reason. Brunel-Laубричан and Duamel-Amadeo suppose that the will to shock honorable peers and church dignitaries by public performances in the face of kings and gatherings of faithful Christians was a strong stimulus to William\(^{38}\).

There were as well some less personal reasons. Speaking of medieval poetry, Paul Zumthor asserts that it is extremely situational and its aim is to fulfill the expectations of the audience then and there\(^{39}\). Upon the acquaintance with some of Williams early poetic experiences his contemporaries could expect new things to come out. The author himself pertains to the community he addresses therefore sharing its ideological and cultural directions, language and vocabulary. Nevertheless he pours casual talk out in fundamentally firm forms of poetic language: their stability prevents it from the contradictions of reality\(^{40}\). Following this principle, the troubadours borrowed the basic elements of their metaphors from feudal system that was initiated by William IX of Aquitaine.

Traditionally the following evidence of influence of “the feudal world” on William's romantic lyrics is drawn: homage to the Lady (canzone VIII, *Qu' ans mi rent a lieu e'm liure Qu'en sa carta'm pot escriure*), description of service to the Lady in made in terms similar to those of vassal service (canzone IX, *celar and blandir*), a ring presented by the Lady as a symbol

---

\(^{36}\) Ibid, p. XI.

\(^{37}\) There are multiple stories where he appears to have quite a sharp tongue. For instance it is known that once a bald priest came to him before his second excommunication to appeal to his conscience and persuade to leave his mistress, Viscountess Châtellerault, William declared: “I won’t break up with her unless and until you comb your chevelure!” – See: Riquer, M de 1975 Los Trovadores. Planeta, Barcelone, pp. 107-108.


\(^{40}\) Ibid, p. 42.
of investiture (canzone X, *m donet ... son anel*), etc. Jeanroy, Wechssler and other researchers were inclined to consider these formulas a prove that the appearance of romantic relations was imitating the appearance of feudal ones; kisses by which the Lady “rescues” the singer (*bais de socor*), rings that she gives to him: in all the above mentioned acts scholars recognize solely actions of symbolic nature and deny any erotic and “humane” implications.

So far as we can judge from his own words, William perceived his romantic relationships as a way to gain the *joï*, to be *joven* in body and spirit and to be healed of his doubts about the nothingness in life (“*Mas elam deu mon mells triar, pos sap c'ab lieis ai a guerir*” (canzone IX, lines 47-48) - but she ought to choose what is best for me because she knows that I shall be saved through her). In order to get this from his Lady, William offers her a kind of contract which he depicts in “feudal”, courtly terms (following description is suitable to the definition of *fin amors*, we can easily distinguish here all the most common courtly love topoi). So, he offers courtly service and progression in courtly society to the Lady, whose reputation he promises to esteem and in return he strives for entering into possession of the joy that she can give, and for retaining her (and her helpful advantageous effects) for his own needs. He turns down any mood of doubts (*estiers cujar*, canzone IX, line 5) and seeks an ultimate delight in a shared and fulfilled love which will bring real benefit in everyday life to the Lady and to himself.

He underlines that he wants to “keep all of her” ("*a mos obs la vueill retenir*" (canzone IX, line 33)); to express this idea he picks up the word “*retenir*” that had a legal meaning “to retain somebody in service”. It is noteworthy that while William’s successors often resort to this term while speaking about the submission of suitors to the Lady, for William himself this word is more flexible, he uses it to describe both of lovers. The troubadour can retain the Lady and so does she. That is a persuasive argument for the thesis that William made use of “feudal” terms without transferring their inner sense on the romantic relationships; for him it was just a part of an ordinary, everyday vocabulary.

I am not sure whether for the reason of use by William of the legal vocabulary it is possible to conclude that he perceived his everyday life as a set of stabled situations implying so precisely defined conduct that it started to resemble the rituals. It’s more likely that the epoch as well as his social status forced William to operate with the “feudal” lexicon; it was natural to him to apply the terminology he was familiar with to illustrate his ideas.

---


42 It seems clear that the Lady is presented here as a Christ figure or at least as a person who can mediate between the God and William himself.
On the basis of textual analysis it is possible to conclude that there are no traces of servility towards the Lady in William’s lyrics (what was quite typical for many successive troubadours). One cannot deny, that it was William who laid the basis for comparing of Lady with a senior, but I believe that it was not his aim. Following R. Lejeune\textsuperscript{43}, I incline to suppose that he used the legal and quasi legal vocabulary in order to enrich his language, to make it more urgent and modern. He invented new formulas but he did not “freeze” or fix it, he never created any stable expressions that he would repeat in several canzones. The Lady was not always presented as a “senior” and the troubadour was not always acting as her vassal. I do not see any evidence of transferring the legal contexts of “feudal” terms used by William on romantic relations he described.

\textsuperscript{43} Lejeune, R 1979, “Formules féodales et style amoureux chez Guillaume IX d’Aquitaine”, in: R Lejeune, Littérature et société occitanes au Moyen Âge, Liège, p. 119.
References


12. Id. & Holland, W (eds.) 1850, Die Lieder Guillems IX, Grafen von Pietieu, Tübingen.


Contact details and disclaimer:

Svetlana A. Yatsyk
National Research University Higher School of Economics (Moscow, Russia). Faculty of History, Centre for medieval studies. PhD-student.
E-mail: syatsyk@hse.ru

Any opinions or claims contained in this Working Paper do not necessarily reflect the views of HSE.

© Yatsyk, 2014